



## 2023 Symposium on Music Teacher Education Presentations

### Session 5 – Saturday, 9:00AM

Libby Gardner Concert Hall

An Equity-informed Trauma Lens for Music Teacher Education

Shannan Hibbard & Rebecca DeWan

The experience of belonging emerges in part from individuals' competencies forming relationships, identifying with their cultural background, developing a sense of identity, and connecting to place (Allen et al., 2021). For students living with the lasting effects of trauma, however, adaptive behaviors can interfere with these competencies (Price, 2023), especially as they apply to forming trusting relationships. Further, recent instances of race and gender-based violence, including legislation limiting discourse around identities such as race, cultural, sexual, and gender, may stigmatize individuals and hinder belonging.

Understanding the impact of trauma, especially as it intersects with marginalization and oppression, is necessary for nurturing spaces of belonging in P, Æi12 and higher education.

The landmark CDC-Kaiser Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) study brought to light the pervasiveness of individual childhood trauma and the connection of such exposure to poor health outcomes as adults (Felitti et al., 1998). However, community factors, including structural racism, generational trauma, and food, housing, and health care insecurity, amplify risk for trauma (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2023). Concerningly, such contextual factors rooted in societal inequities can exacerbate individual trauma. As such, considerations of trauma cannot be separated from issues of equity.

Moreover, in the context of education, it is essential to acknowledge the role schools play in causing and perpetuating trauma (Venet, 2021), particularly among students of marginalized identities. Bullying and harassment, curricular and racial violence (Ighodaro & Wiggan, 2013) and school policies and policing that result in harsh discipline create the conditions for schools to be sites of harm (Venet, 2021). For students living with the lasting effects of trauma, their adaptive behaviors and learning challenges, often misinterpreted as misbehavior or non-compliance, put them at further risk for being retraumatized at school (Hibbard & Price, 2023). Seen this way, inequitable school policies and conditions can cause and worsen trauma for students who may need the most support.

Trauma-informed approaches rooted in considerations of equity resist deficit and salvationist narratives by calling on educators to work toward fixing inequitable systems, not children (Shalaby, 2017; Love, 2019; Venet, 2021). At the school level, equity-centered trauma-informed approaches focus on the universal application of compassionate trauma care through relationship-centering (Hibbard, 2021), asset-based pedagogies (Ginright, 2016; Love, 2019), and creating spaces for trauma to be expressed in curriculum (Dutro, 2019; Emmanuel, 2022). A universal approach to trauma as a lens rather than a treatment applied after trauma is known acknowledges how naming "trauma children" is further marginalizing.

In this session we will begin by exploring the critical considerations that emerge from the intersections of trauma and equity. We will then address how music teacher educators may model and promote an equity-informed approach to trauma through relationship-centering and identity development. Finally, we will discuss developmental support for preservice music teachers as they enter the profession.

### DGH 270

Disruptive Practices for Change in Music Teacher Education

Brian Weidner

As undergraduate students engage in music teacher education, they frequently encounter two conflicting models of music education: the one that is being presented in the collegiate classroom and the one that they learned through an apprenticeship of observation during their pre-collegiate music training (Haston & Leon-Guerrero, 2008; Lortie, 1977). These implicitly learned models of music education can dominate the practices of pre-service and career music educators (Dobbs, 2014; Powell & Parker, 2017; Schmidt 1998). In order for substantive change to occur in the profession as a result of collegiate studies, undergraduate music educators need to have disruptive experiences that present and sustain other models of music education from those which they experienced themselves (Author, in press; Bennett & Moore, 2023; Olvera-Fernández et al, 2022).

This critical case study documented the experiences of undergraduate music education students at a mid-sized private university in the Midwest as they experienced a curriculum intentionally designed to apply a model of disruption to self-sustaining cycles of music teacher education (Author, in press). This model was adapted from models of teacher education developed by Lortie (1977) and Korthagen (2010). Participants in this study were interviewed using a semi-structured protocol that investigated students' pre-collegiate music education, experiences with disruptive teaching practices, and impacts of these practices on their

developing identity as music educators. The disruptive experiences in this program included exposure to student-led learning, emphasis on practices for equity and access, and non-traditional ensembles and performance practices.

Previous educational experiences greatly impacted participants in this study, as many described a desire to emulate their own teachers and described their ideal future classrooms in ways that closely resembled their own experiences. With this said, they also noted the influence that their undergraduate studies had in expanding their considerations of what was important and could be included within their practice. In particular, they showed to be particularly amenable to new approaches when disruptive experiences did not directly conflict with their own backgrounds. This willingness to alter their own philosophical orientation to music education was particularly malleable around issues of diversity, equity, inclusion, and access, as many had never previously considered these issues as part of music education. Concepts of student-centered learning, non-traditional ensembles, and concept-based teaching that challenged the roles of the director, performance practice, and competition were frequently incorporated as compromises to previous experiences, as opposed to being fully adopted as presented in music teacher education coursework.

Noticeable differences were observed in the experiences of students at various points in the curriculum. While first year and sophomore students often observed the strangeness or novelty of disruptive experiences, junior students (the most advanced students in this study) noted pedagogical implications of these disruptive experiences and observed how they could impact the learning of their future students. They noted that their frequent encounters with disruptive experiences, accompanied by extensive clinical experiences, allowed them to consider how new concepts could be integrated into their visions of music education.

## DGH 272

### I'm Not Fine; No One is Fine: An Exploration of Undergraduate Music Students' Experiences with Mental Health Challenges

Stephanie Prichard

Over the last decade, the prevalence of mental health problems has risen steadily among undergraduate students (Lipson et al., 2019, 2022). Although certain accounts indicate an uptick in mental health-related needs as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, most empirical evidence points toward a steady trend over more than 10 years (Ableson et al., 2022). Rates of mental health treatment have also risen in college populations (Lipson et al., 2019) such that students' mental health needs exceed available resources (Thornton et al, 2017). The result of the increased caseload is a need to prioritize life-threatening cases, leaving many students without regular access to campus mental health professionals.

With health centers unable to handle the influx of student mental health concerns, some institutions have asked faculty to notice indicators of distress and refer students appropriately. While some degree of awareness from instructional personnel seems reasonable, many faculty report feeling ill-equipped to assist students struggling with mental health (Ableson et al., 2022), and college administrators report struggling to prepare personnel to effectively support students with mental health needs (Dryer et al., 2016; Hong, 2015).

Beyond appropriate care, classroom accommodations are a necessary consideration for many students with mental health challenges. However, access to wellbeing support is often requires students to demonstrate a need or disclose a disability (Francis et al., 2020). Such pressures may be a barrier for students concerned about stigma or uncomfortable with the degree of vulnerability required. Further, although ongoing family support is often crucial for students with mental health challenges (Dallas et al., 2015), FERPA right of disclosure regulations (FERPA, 1974) prevent direct communication between institutional personnel and families of college students.

A strategic, data-driven approach is needed to establish and guide policies related to the growing challenges associated with collegiate student mental health and wellbeing (Ableson et al., 2022). In order to move toward practices that support student wellbeing there is a need to explore and understand students' experiences while pursuing a credit-heavy music degree program. Therefore, the purpose of this study was to explore undergraduate students' experiences navigating mental health challenges while pursuing a music degree. I employed critical case sampling to include six undergraduate music majors who self-identified as having one or more mental health challenges impacting their day to day academic and personal lives. Data sources included interviews and participant journals over the course of two semesters. Findings included the importance of familial and/or peer support, varied perceptions of university faculty and administrators' interests in students' wellbeing, challenges related to seeking and securing consistent care and accommodations, and a possible need for discipline-specific mental health care in higher education.

This presentation is most closely related to the work of the Music Teacher Health & Wellness ASPA. As it involves preservice music teachers' experiences with mental health challenges and marginalization, this presentation is also a natural fit within the 2023 symposium theme: Elevating a Culture of Belonging.

## DGH 302

### I Made it in But Do I Belong Here? Martina's Story

Elizabeth Chappell

The purpose of this narrative inquiry was to re-story the experiences of a first-generation Latina pre-service music educator. Martina attended a large and competitive music school within a university in the Southern United States. Due to a well-established program sponsored by her local symphony, she had received free high-quality private violin lessons throughout her

childhood and had auditioned successfully into several college music programs. Despite her abilities, Martina struggled throughout her college years to feel a sense of belonging among her peers and professors which she attributed to cultural differences and attitudes toward the field of music education. As a child, Martina's parent's undocumented status negatively impacted her feelings of belongingness within her wider community and her father, who died when she was 16, had instilled a sense of pride in her Mexican heritage. As a result, she felt a strong connection with those from marginalized communities. Martina's violin teacher was also Latina and growing up, had benefitted from the same symphony sponsored program as did many of her high school classmates. For Martina, these factors created a strong sense of belonging in the orchestra setting as she experienced it, which led her to major in music. Among her college musician peers and professors however, she struggled to feel as if she fit in. She cited differences in communication styles and even style of dress as factors that contributed to these feelings. She was able to reconnect somewhat when she took string music education courses and when she and I established a mentor/mentee relationship. She and I reflect on the ways in which college music programs can promote connections among students and on inclusive strategies that could help those from a variety of backgrounds and perspectives feel more connected in the college setting. Her story is unique and provides an important perspective for those interested in promoting a truly diverse, equitable, and inclusive environment in higher education communities.

### DGH 306

#### “Can I Student Teach Here?!”: Preservice Music Teachers' Field-Observations at a School for the Blind & Visually Impaired

Becky Marsh

Early field experiences are a common element of music teacher education programs and have been identified as important in the socialization and identity development of preservice music teachers (Albert, 2016; Conkling, 2004; Haston & Russell, 2012; Hourigan & Scheib, 2009). However, the influence of field-observation experiences on identity development has been neglected in these inquiries (Marsh, 2018). In considering the contexts in which we might situate these observations, music education research consistently indicates that music educators often receive little preparation in effectively teaching students with disabilities (Adamek & Darrow, 2010; Culp & Salvador, 2021; Grimsby, 2020; Hammel & Hourigan, 2011; Hourigan, 2009; Salvador & Pasiali, 2017). Research addressing early field-observation experiences in music classrooms that center students with disabilities may provide valuable insight for this aspect of preservice music teacher education (Marsh & Esswein, 2022). The purpose of this instrumental case study (Stake, 1995) was to examine field-observation experiences of preservice music teachers at a school for the blind and visually impaired. The “grand tour” question guiding this study was, how do preservice music teachers enrolled in a course designed to prepare them to work with students with disabilities make meaning of their observations in music classrooms comprised solely of students who are blind or have visual impairments? Using a framework for teacher identity development that includes both psychological and sociological components (Pishghadam et al., 2022), I sought to address the following subquestions:

1. What do preservice music teachers notice during their field observations in these music classrooms?
2. In what ways, if any, do preservice music teachers draw connections between their teacher identities and what they notice during these observations?
3. How do preservice music teachers negotiate the aspects of their observations that conflict with or disrupt their teacher identities?

Participants were first-year preservice music teachers (N = 7) enrolled in a music teacher education program at a small, private midwestern university. They represented diverse educational and musical backgrounds, and different sexual orientations, races, genders, and social classes. The participants observed two music classes, (1) a fifth-grade general music class and (2) a high-school piano class. Data were collected through class assignments (pre-observation assignments, post-observation reflections), individual semi-structured interviews, a focus group interview, and researcher fieldnotes. Using a multi-cycle coding process (Saldaña, 2021), the data currently are being analyzed to identify themes.

Emergent themes include the nature of teacher-student communication, curricular connections and considerations, and accessibility through Universal Design for Learning. Participants also experienced disruptions to the deficit mindset about disability. Through an examination of these findings, music teacher educators may be better equipped to create standalone coursework or embedded experiences across the curriculum that empower preservice music teachers to prioritize accessibility and inclusivity.

### DGH 318

#### An Exploration of the Experiences of Former Women Band Directors

Emily Moler

Women band director experiences have been a topic of interest among music education researchers over the past 10-15 years. Of these studies which have highlighted the common challenges experienced by women in the profession, many revolve around the need for women to perform gender in order to assume a masculine persona—a characteristic often expected as a part of the job (Fischer-Croneis, 2016; Foley, 2019; Furman, 2012; Mullan, 2014; Sears, 2014). As a result, women participants have shared challenges and obstacles related to career entry (Bovin, 2019; Fischer-Croneis, 2016; Furman, 2012; Mullan, 2014), harassment (Bovin, 2019; Mullan, 2014; Sears, 2018), motherhood (Bovin, 2019; Fischer-Croneis, 2016; Fitzpatrick, 2013; Mullan, 2014;

Webb, 2021; Wilson, 2014), mentor relationships (Cox, 2020; Kincaide, 2021; Moore, 2022; Mullan, 2014) and challenges related to professional identities (Fischer-Croneis, 2016; Foley, 2019; Kincaide, 2021; Mullan, 2014; Sears, 2010). Further research is needed to examine how such challenges among women may be affecting attrition, and what factors are impactful in these experiences. The purpose of this study is to understand how former women high school band directors make sense of their past experiences in high school band directing. Using feminism as an analytical tool and phenomenology as a theoretical framework, I examine these lived experiences as a part of conductor socialization which interconnects with both music teacher educational training and societal expectations.

Research questions: 1) How do former women band directors make meaning of their experiences? 2) In what ways do psychological constructs, such as, but not limited to, Impostor Phenomenon, vulnerability, and perfectionism impact the ways that women band directors make meaning of their experiences? 3) What factors or elements of the women band director experiences impact women's decisions to stay, move in, or leave the profession? 4) How do intersections of identity impact women band directors' experiences?

To answer these questions, I am conducting an interpretative phenomenological analysis with nine participants. All participants identify as women, have taught as high school band directors for at least five years, and have moved into higher education music education as either Ph.D. students or music education faculty. Utilizing a modified version of Seidman's three interview protocol, I am exploring musical life histories, reconstructed band directing experiences, and emergent themes. At the completion of first interviews, preliminary findings point to several emergent themes which warrant further investigation in the remaining interviews: 1) The importance of support from women family members. 2) The experience of being hired to work in struggling programs or to create music programs. 3) The presence of self-identified perfectionism among some participants. 4) Toxicity in entry to higher education. All interviews and analysis will be completed by the conference date.

This work has important implications. The findings of this study will further illuminate and advance the research literature about the experiences of women high school band directors. Additionally, the results may provide insight and guidance to help strengthen preservice teacher training for women desiring to become high school band directors and those who may wish to teach in higher education.

## DGH 324

### Thinking Like a Teacher: Using Case Studies in Introduction to Music Education Courses

D. Gregory Springer, Nickolas Doshier & Andrew Dubbert

Case studies are often used as pedagogical tools in professional preparation for many fields, such as business, law, and medicine (Leggett & Smith, 2022; Zakrajsek & Nilson, 2023). They are also used in teacher education to better prepare preservice teachers for successful teaching careers (Abrahams & Head, 2005; Lorencová et al., 2019; Shulman, 1992). Richardson (1997) described case studies as "fictional narratives" (p. 17) that are based on authentic teaching situations. Cases used for study can include teacher-in-action cases (where a hypothetical teacher is described in instructional roles) or teacher-in-community cases (where a hypothetical teacher is portrayed interacting with administrators, parents, or community members; Richardson, 1997). Music teacher educators have described various benefits of case studies in music education courses, such as encouraging reflective thinking (Bailey, 2000), stimulating lively classroom discussion (Lind, 2001), helping students develop a teacher identity (Richardson, 1997), and offering students the opportunity to experience different teaching situations before student teaching (Hourigan, 2008). Although previous case study applications have been reported in upper-division music methods courses (Bailey, 2000; Conway, 1999), none have explored the use of case studies in introductory music education courses.

With this project, we discuss the implementation of case study experiences in an Introduction to Music Education course taught in two consecutive semesters. Students enrolled in the course read 6 case studies throughout the semester that portrayed a music educator who faced some sort of dilemma. After reading each case study, students wrote a reflection in response to the case study as an out-of-class assignment. Then, students engaged in an in-class discussion with their peers regarding the case study. At the conclusion of the semester, we examined student perceptions, instructor reflections, and reflections from the teaching assistants for the course to evaluate what aspects of the experience were successful and what aspects may need to be modified in the future. Responses from students generally indicate that they enjoyed the experience. They described the best aspects of the experience as the real-world quality of the case studies, the problem-solving nature of the activity, the critical thinking required of students, and the ability to "think like a teacher." Regarding negative aspects of the experience, students described the written portion as an added homework burden, and some described the challenge of the activity as an obstacle. Most students indicated that the experience shaped their identity as a teacher because it encouraged them to consider their personal value system and put them in the mindset of a teacher.

Student responses and instructor/teaching assistant reflections indicate that reading, reflecting on, and discussing case studies resulted in a positive educational experience overall. These responses also suggest that case studies can be used successfully in Introduction to Music Education courses to encourage students to begin to think like a teacher early in their degree program. Aligned with the goals of the Critical Examination of the Curriculum ASPA, this presentation will include recommendations and best practices for music teacher educators who may consider including case studies in their music education courses.