Navigating and examining conceptions of music teaching

SMTE Symposium
September 27, 2013

Janet R. Barrett
The University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
The vitality of music teacher education rests on our personal and professional conceptions of good music teaching. What are the visions we hold for music teaching? Do these visions align with the real work of teachers? How do these visions drive our interactions with pre-service and in-service teachers, and the educative experiences we create? What visions do we hold for the future of music teaching?
Mapping the landscape

See a map of the Hundred Acre Wood from *Winnie the Pooh*

See a map of Milo’s journey through Dictionopolis and Digitopolis from Norman Juster’s *The Phantom Tollbooth*

See the series “New States” and “States of Mind” by artist Lordy Rodriguez
Envisioning a music teacher education program . . .
Selected excerpts from 2010 Illinois Professional Teaching Standards

The competent teacher:
knows strategies to implement behavior management and behavior intervention planning to ensure a safe and productive learning environment.

uses assessment data, student work samples, and observations from continuous monitoring of student progress to plan and evaluate effective content area reading, writing, and oral communication instruction; needs, goals, and responses.

understands how to make data-driven decisions using assessment results to adjust practices to meet the needs of each student.

collaborates with others in the use of data to design and implement effective school interventions that benefit all students.

evaluates best practices and research-based materials against benchmarks within the disciplines.

understands the roles of an advocate, the process of advocacy, and its place in combating or promoting certain school district practices affecting students.
The cultural legacy that still influences the scientific method is reductionist—that is, by dividing and endlessly subdividing the objects of our research and analysis, we separate interconnected phenomena and processes to develop specialized expertise. But the focusing of attention on ever narrower slices of the whole often comes at the expense of attention to the whole, which can cause us to miss the significance of emergent phenomena that spring unpredictably from the interconnections and interactions among multiple processes and networks. That is one reason why linear projections of the future are so often wrong. (Gore, 2013, p. xxi)

STATE OF IOWA
HIGH SCHOOL NORMAL TRAINING
EXAMINATION

Thursday a. m., May 18, 1933

MUSIC

(Answer but five questions and number each answer
to correspond to the question answered.)

1. (a) Make a staff, naming the lines and spaces.
   (b) Make five kinds of notes and their corresponding rests.

2. Tell what must be accomplished before the children are ready to sing the words with a new tune.

3. (a) Explain how music may be correlated with physical education.
   (b) Explain how music may be correlated with penmanship.
   (c) Explain how music may be correlated with art.

4. (a) Define a scale.
   (b) Tell how the major scale is formed.

5. Write the major scale in the following keys: G, A, E flat, and D flat, using quarter notes.

6. (a) Explain Iowa's plan for the rural school choir.
   (b) Name five choir songs which you will have your pupils know.
Oh my, the omissions!

How do we map out more imaginative, generous, and just versions of music teacher education?
Starting places for developing program vision . . .
What should music [teacher] education be like? What should be its effects on the people it comprises, the communities in which it takes place, and the general and wider society of which it is a part?

Jorgensen, Transforming Music Education, 2003, p. 118

Characteristics of Teacher Education Programs that Foster Intellectual Growth

1. The opportunity to create, invent, and improvise.
2. The opportunity to practice the art of perception.
3. The opportunity for reflection.
4. The opportunity to represent ideas and experience.
5. The opportunity to collaborate.
6. The opportunity to engage in genuine inquiry.
7. The opportunity to experience.
8. The opportunity to study ideas and settings holistically so that relationships and connections may be explored.
9. Opportunities to participate in mentoring, modeling, and apprenticeship activities.
10. An emphasis on growth, on learning “in process.”

(Rogers, 1985, pp. 251-253)

2008-2012

NASM Music Teacher Education Working Group

Rob Cutietta, University of Southern California
Janet R. Barrett, Northwestern University
Andre de Quadros, Boston University
William Fredrickson, Florida State University
Leila Heil, University of Colorado-Boulder
Linda Thompson, Lee University
Betty Anne Younker, University of Western Ontario
NASM Question Set #1: Curricula

Based on our goals for music, teaching, and music teaching, what content and levels of knowledge and skills are:

- essential no matter what the future brings? Why?
- important, especially short term—the period we can reasonably predict? Why?
- desirable? Why?
To what extent do our answers change depending on

Teaching specialization?
Location?
How general or specialized our preparation goals are?
Cultural contexts and expertise in our institution?
Realities in our institution?
What do our answers reveal about content priorities?

What challenges emerge when we compare our answers to [these questions] with what we are doing?

Additional Questions:
- Knowledge & Skills
- Content, Capabilities, Attributes & Relationships specific to Musicians and Teachers
- Practice
- Creative Exploration
NASM Question Set #2: Action Plans for Change

Define a focus
Situation Analysis & Self Reflection
Considering specific changes
Implementing change
Enter “question set” in search field
Collegial discussions regarding program visions . . .

imagine and generate possibilities

inform and deepen the conversation

prioritize . . . emphasize

contextualize . . . seek “good fit”

revisit in reflective cycles

evaluate the coherence and integrity of our programs
Hammerness’ Program Vision: Shared beliefs about what teaching practice should be like

“An orientation refers to a set of ideas about the goals of teacher preparation and the means for achieving them” (p. 74)

Academic orientation
Practical orientation
Technological orientation
Personal orientation
Critical/social orientation

Academic orientation
teacher’s role as subject matter specialist

Practical orientation
aspects of craft that practitioners use in their work

Technological orientation
proficiency--the knowledge and skills of teaching

Personal orientation
personal growth, inquiry, teacher as learner, agency

Critical/social orientation
progressive social vision with a critique of schooling

How do the various texts that preservice teachers encounter align with personal and program visions of teaching and learning?
Does a particular orientation come to mind?

[This book] presents a challenge to the traditional and dominant view of teacher education as training, [which] presents a distorted image of the beginning teacher as passive, isolated, and rightfully dependent on the expertise and experience of others . . . In contrast [this book] emphasizes education . . . the use of methods that lead or draw out, that educe. Thus, we begin form a view that knowledge is socially constructed and humans are actors within dynamic social contexts. (p. xii)

[This book] is “concerned about the lives of children and youth based on the idea that love of our own and other people’s children can be the robust, vivid, and hopeful organizing center of our efforts . . . [Understanding children better] requires a vision of teaching as intellectual and ethical work, an enterprise that requires a thinking and caring person at the center. Teachers must find ways to sustain those qualities as active and healthy in environments that demand them, and in situations bent on destruction” (pp. xi-xii)
[This book] presents a challenge to the traditional and dominant view of teacher education as training, [which] presents a distorted image of the beginning teacher as passive, isolated, and rightfully dependent on the expertise and experience of others . . . In contrast [this book] emphasizes education . . . the use of methods that lead or draw out, that educe. Thus, we begin form a view that knowledge is socially constructed and humans are actors within dynamic social contexts. (p. xii)

[This book] is “concerned about the lives of children and youth based on the idea that love of our own and other people’s children can be the robust, vivid, and hopeful organizing center of our efforts . . . [Understanding children better] requires a vision of teaching as intellectual and ethical work, an enterprise that requires a thinking and caring person at the center. Teachers must find ways to sustain those qualities as active and healthy in environments that demand them, and in situations bent on destruction” (pp. xi-xii)

Systematic study of program conceptions
Examples: On a Large Scale

“Endorsements”

I sought out Bank Street graduates in all my positions in the last ten years.
New York City school principal

Wheelock does a better job of preparing early childhood teachers than any place I know.
Boston school principal

Mixed methods study of 7 exemplary teacher education programs

Data collection:
• Review of program documents
• Review of descriptive data on all teaching candidates for the previous three years
• Interviews and focus groups with program participants
• Observation of courses within the program
• Observations of other learning settings
• Interviews with and selective observations of program graduates
• Surveys of program graduates
  • N = 551; Comparison group sample, N = 429
• Surveys of the employers of program graduates

Some components of strong programs:

• A common, clear vision of good teaching permeates all coursework and clinical experiences.
• Explicit strategies help students (1) confront their own deep-seated beliefs and assumptions about learning and students and 2) learn about the experiences of people different from themselves.
• Case study methods, teacher research, performance assessments, and portfolio evaluation apply learning to real problems of practice.

Cautions and contexts to keep in mind . . .
The goal of a program orientation is not to produce teachers as “carbon copies” of one another

Insert enormous image of a chameleon used for advertising purposes by a paint manufacturing company
The nature of experience

A study of interaction, continuity, and community

Hey, have you worked with any good tame problems lately?

Know any good wicked problems?
Wicked problems of music teacher education

- Conceptualizing (good, ethical, excellent) teaching
- Designing fair, fitting, and flexible systems for music teacher evaluation
- Aligning musical practices and programs to realize the aims of social justice
- Closing the gap of access to music study for underrepresented groups
- Diversifying the music teaching force
- Responding with clarity to conflicting and competing policy claims about the benefits of music study
- Fostering productive collaborations between schools and universities and within schools of music
- Generating innovative and sustainable curricular reform
- Preparing new music teachers for an uncertain future

An Ecological View

Conceptualizing music teacher education as a “Wicked Problem”

Welcome to Musictopia

We seek a coherence of principle and practice in constructing a music teacher education curriculum worthy of the next generation of teachers.