The Transition from Music Student to Music Teacher: A Summary of the Research Literature

Prepared by

The Preservice Music Teacher Special Action Group
The Society for Music Teacher Education
Established September 2005
Don Ester, Facilitator

Phase I of Action Plan
April 2006

Contributing Authors

Kristen Albert	West Chester University of PA
Warren Haston	Georgia State University
Daniel Hellman	Anna Maria College
Ryan Hourigan	University of Michigan
Peter Miksza	Indiana University
Michael W. Moore	Bob Jones University
Michael Raiber	University of Oklahoma
John Scheib	Ball State University

Preparation of Summary Document:
Don Ester   Ball State University

Literature Table
SMTE Preservice Music Teacher SAG – Miksza – 2005/06
Musician/Performer Role Conflict

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Barresi, A. (1980)	Could not locate.			
Beynon, C. (1998)	Could not locate.			
Bernard, R. (2004)	*N*=6, 3m, 3f, classroom music teachers grades K-6	Working from the notion that musicianship and teaching are complimentary sources of satisfaction for music teachers rather than inherently contradictory activities	Open-ended interview format: Questions: Tell me how you came to be a music educator? Tell me how you came to be a musician? Tell me about your teaching? Tell me about your music?	Derived three approaches from emergent coding analyses: a) perceiving teaching and music making as separate activities; b) approaching teaching and making music from a performer's perspective and c) making the music making experiences they value possible for their students Many citations regarding visual art teacher identity – not often described by this population as a dichotomy
Bouij,C. (1998)	*N*=169, pre-service teachers from all 6 Swedish higher ed music programs, a longitudinal project tracking the students throughout their career	McCall and Simmons sociological definition of *'role identity'* (p. 24) Shibutani definition of *'reference groups'* (p. 26)	Grounded Theory Questions for music teachers: How does a pre-service music teacher see themselves in terms of their future occupational role? Who can I be/What do I want to be? How do music teachers see themselves with respect to their environment?	Created four role-identity dimensions: a) all-around musician; b) pupil-centered teacher; c) performer and d) content-centered teacher (see p. 25 for descriptions of each) The dimensions are hypothesized to exist on two axes: individual musical concept (all-around vs. performer) and role of the profession (teacher vs. content centered) Discussion Items: Music ed training makes it difficult to sustain a performer image. A crucial developmental point may be when students decide if they can or can not make a living performing. Results found may depend on the specific performing environment in Sweden. It is important to consider the philosophical match of identities between cooperating teacher and pre-service teacher. All-around musicians tend to possess an anthropological view of music whereas performers tend to place emphasis on aesthetic value.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Bouij, C. (2004)	Same as above	Same as above. Also: Reinharz definition of *'socialization'* (p. 2) "Habermas' theory of communicative interaction" (p. 3) Habermas' view of society as *'life world'* (p. 4)	Grounded Theory Additional clarification of study aims: Three components of role identity explored: a) competence – what the individual is actually expected to master; b) what is socio-culturally expected of a person in any particular situation and c) what the person considers to be desirable and/or suitable	Reiteration of model above. Other salient observations made by the researcher: Swedish students may choose to be a music education major only after their entrance audition. Music teaching is some times seen as an option for those who cannot perform. Development of all-around musician identity could be a means of self-preservation when performing ability is insufficient. Suggests that women may be more likely to adopt a student-centered rather than content-centered approach. Some students claim that they are in school not to become a teacher or musician or some combination but simply to develop themselves. Over half of the teachers in the study also perform on the side.
Brand, M. (1988)	None – Position Paper	Perry Model – *Forms of Intellectual and Ethical Development in the College Years* Developed at Harvard in the 1950's through interviews with male college students	Model presents four world-views: a) dualism; b) multiplicity; c) relativism; d) commitment to relativism. Focuses on cognitive development… Suggests that each students goes through all phases (a to d) in order… Researcher calls for a greater refinement of measurement tools and discusses implications of the model for music education (e.g., what students can understand when, how and when they make career commitments, reaction to method class instruction, degree of intellectual maturity).	
Conkling, S. (2004)	*N*=3, pre-service music teachers, selected for the representativeness of their stories (member checks conducted with each participant), cautions that narrative descriptions are not identical representations of reality	Investigating how professional development school (i.e., Holmes Group) experiences may impact the development of music teacher identity differently than experiences gained in traditional teacher preparation programs. Connelly and Clandinin narrative/phenomenological construction of identity	Phenomenological-narrative approach: Includes researchers thoughts and opinions… Consists primarily of anecdotal retelling of participant experiences… Does not create composite characters or story lines… Chooses cases that the researcher believes exemplifies recurring phenomena…	Researcher's Observations: Traditional method classes may prevent pre-service music teachers from imagining themselves as teachers – instead they may treat methods courses as traditional academic subjects. Cognitive apprenticeship element of the PDS is important – students appreciate being able to see the thoughts and processes behind a cooperating teacher's actions over time. Power of PDS experience lies in its "plurality and malleability" – encouraging multiple ways of doing things and allowing the student time to reflect and change during the field experience.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Frierson-Campbell, C. (2004)	*N* varies by year of the project, Year 1 – *n=4*, Year 2 – *n=11*, Year 3 – *n=76*	Drawing on previous work by Bouij (see above) and Roberts (see below). Presents experiences of putting together a collaborative project between William Patterson University and inner city public school teachers in Northern New Jersey. Exploring the possibility that music teacher identity continues to change after initiation into the field. Also exploring specific issues salient to inner city music educators.	Action-research: Professional partnership established between University music education department and public school music teachers over three years.	The researcher describes three phases of the project: a) year one – *who are you and what do you want?* b) year two – *the coalition of music teachers* and c) year three – *the formal needs assessment.* Year 1 – discussions with music teachers reveal feelings of marginalization (e.g., used to fill in prep periods for other teachers, not included in primary faculty meetings, given a lack of in-service opportunities, and ignored by administration). The music teachers did not feel like members of a teacher culture. Music teachers were discouraged from organizing performances (administrators were concerned about student management issues). Some music teachers felt that it was more important for them to teach the students how to read English than music. Administrators were primarily concerned with how music could support the other subjects in the curriculum. Year 2 – more teachers were included at this point. Music teachers took over the direction of the partnership suggesting that a needs assessment and brainstorming session would be the most useful at this time. Year 3 – this stage consisted of a formal needs assessment resulting in prioritized lists of issues and concerns. When asked to list factors contributing to success in urban settings, over two thirds of the participants responses dealt with personal or teaching traits whereas only 14.3% dealt with musicianship. Overall, the participants expressed a great deal of conflict between the music teacher identities they held and the expectations they perceive from others (e.g., administrators).

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Froehlich, H., & L'roy, D. (1985)	*N*=118 undergraduate music ed majors (band, strings, choral) administered a questionnaire, then …*n*=39 undergraduate randomly selected for additional interview	Problem: Undergraduate music teachers' lack of commitment to teaching may be due to formal training. Draws from Merton's concept of *'occupational socialization'* – characterized by a) the acquisition of a professional ideology; b) a commitment to work specific tasks and skills and c) career commitment (p. 65) Purpose: investigate the occupational identity of undergraduate music education majors	Mixed methodology: Quantitative survey followed by open-ended interview Subjects asked to rate various musical skills and knowledge criteria as either essential, important but not essential, and important and essential.	Results not clearly delineated between main and sub-sample: Most decided to pursue music as a career by age 14… Many had HS teaching experience (e.g., conducting, teacher's aid) while still in school and cite this as a reason for going into teaching… Most students considered themselves 'professional performers' rather than 'musicians' or 'music educators' (especially strings)… Private teacher was the most common option chosen for second choice for occupation… Subjects considered the professional opinion of their applied teachers more important than those of the music education faculty… Those who perceived themselves as performers were also less certain about their professional career choice…
Hedden, S. K. (1973)	*N*=705 High School musicians from 9 schools in North Carolina	Purpose: To get a sense of how high school students perceive music teachers in the hopes of informing pre-service music teachers as to what their students will expect of them.	Quantitative survey, factor analytic data reduction Semantic differential scales built on 20 adjective pairings. Subjects asked to rate each pair based on the following concepts: music, music teacher, pop musician, classical musician, teacher, male, and female.	Selected results: Two factors derived from the analysis labeled by the researcher as a) potency-activity and b) evaluation. The scores for each concept (see left) were then plotted on two axes using the derived factor scores. Music teacher was rated as more delicate, weak, timid, lenient, and relaxed than pop musicians and less strict than general teacher. Overall the results suggest that music teacher was perceived to be different than classical musicians, pop musicians, and teachers… in other words, its own concept.
Henry, M. L. (2005)	It may be useful to consider how music teacher certification practices shape music teacher identity development.			
Leonard, C. (1982)	Could not locate.			
Mark, D. (1998)	Review of studies from a wide variety of European sources Some discussion of the author's own research, yet is not always clear which specific study/sample is being discussed… …perhaps due to translation?	Problem: That the undeveloped identity of a music teacher may be a result of contradictory interests from many fields (e.g., musicology, theory, performance, etc.)	Literature Review Mostly European and Canadian researchers	Summary/Conclusions: Prestige of music education track is a problem in the universities. Music educators may find satisfaction performing on the side. The general attitude towards music in society is poor. Those who primarily consider themselves to be performers tend to be more disappointed as teachers

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Mark, D. (1998) - CONTINUED Some general notes on several of the studies included in this review…	Some salient points made in the review: UK: Gathered from interview… Reasons for more integration between music teacher education and performance (those studying to be musicians) stated by Ritterman, director Royal College of Music, UK: a) most musicians end up teaching anyway; b) understanding the teaching process could help one's own learning; c) there is a shortage of music teacher educators; d) British orchestras have an increasing interest in community and educational outreach programs Denmark: Information regarding Danish music teacher training (Kosa, 1997): All music students are in the same curriculum for their first year of school… they then specialize by interest for years two through four. Austria: Information regarding Austrian music education (anecdotal?): Musical-artistic education not valued in society as it once was due to more emphasis on scientific-technical education. Much of music education (especially instrumental) has been moved out of the public schools… it is now taking place in community schools (private academies?) and through private teaching. Austrian music teacher education programs average 80% of credit hours in musical knowledge and skills and only 20% in pedagogical knowledge and skills. Author describes *"Praxisschock"* – the severe mismatch of training in school with the skills needed for the job (p. 13). Results from Niessen (1995) [not clear – due to translation?], survey data from [sample not specified] 75% of students felt that musicianship was the most developed in their undergraduate training yet the least important for their teaching. Results from Pfieffer (1994) [not clear – due to translation?], survey data from 45 German music teachers. Pedagogical qualities were rated as much more important than musical knowledge in regards to teaching. However, the subjects also considered their musical activities outside of school as an important part of their job satisfaction. Results from Kundrat (1991) [not clear – due to translation?], interview data from 76 high school music teachers in Austria(?). Sites several problems: a) a disconnect between the music studied in universities (e.g., art music) and the music that young people enjoy (e.g., rock, pop); b) music teacher is more emotionally invested in their subject than other teachers and therefore become more frustrated; c) it is difficult to impart theoretical and practical knowledge(?); d) those who see themselves as music teachers rather than musicians tend to be more fulfilled with their career whereas those who consider themselves to be musicians are more likely to be disappointed. Primary results: a) the entrance requirements for music teacher education programs are poorly designed; b) there is not enough pedagogical training as compared to musical training in teacher education programs – results in *Praxisschock*; and c) frustrated music teachers do not necessarily appear to be 'failed artists.'			

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Mills, J. (2004)	N=37, UK conservatory alumni who are now serving as higher education performance professors …this group is compared to a reference group of N=231 other alumni from a UK conservatory Both groups include: keyboard, strings, brass, woodwind, voice, percussion [uneven balance of detailed sample vs. reference group presents problems when analyzing using parametric statistical tests]	Primary questions/basis of investigation: Do the early careers of musicians who eventually become professors differ from those of their peers? Why do some performers teach? Why do some performers who teach become performer-teachers? In what ways do performer-teachers believe that experience of teaching enhances their standard of performance?	Quantitative Interview Study Focus of interview (see p. 251 for actual questions): The proportion of working time spent on different activities. The proportion of income derived from these activities. The musician's professional identity. The musician's vision or aspirations. Data are gathered for the first 5 years after graduation (based on memory) and the last 5 years.	Selected results: 84% of the all alumni (combine N=268) state that teaching is an integral part of their identity. General statements regarding how the subjects' teaching informs their performing as summarized by the researcher: a) improves one's ability to analyze own playing; b) assists in the maintenance of one's own technique; c) requires one to analyze and evaluate one's own practice skills; d) provides a stimulus for self-reflection; e) exposes own playing in front of a critical audience; f) increases awareness of communication achieved in one's own playing; g) introduces them to more repertoire. Researcher makes a distinction between two identity orientations: performer-teachers (e.g., those who draw on teaching to help their performing) and teacher-performers (e.g., those who draw on their playing skills to help their teaching).
Mills, J. & Smith, J. (2003)	N=138 instrumental music teachers from 8 local English "educational sources(?)", woodwind and brass (n=35), strings (n=13), percussion (n=45), keyboard (n=22), vocal (n=6), other (n=7) 83% of the teachers qualified (e.g., university, conservatory, equivalent)	Investigating music teacher beliefs about effective teaching. Comparing "qualified teachers" vs. "unqualified" Comparison by sex.	Mixed methodology – semi-structured interview methodology (emergent coding data analyses) Seven questions: Two concerning the opinions of good teaching for public and higher education. Two asking subjects to reflect on the teaching they received. Two questions regarding perceived influences on their own teaching (past teaching and otherwise). One about the most challenging aspects of their job.	Selected results: Technical focus and breadth of repertoire considered somewhat important hallmarks of good teaching in public and higher education. Reported memories of strengths of their own teachers included 'having an accomplished teacher (performer?)' and 'good teaching of technique.' Reported memories of weaknesses of their own teachers included 'insufficient attention to musical skills (e.g., improvisation, interpretation)' and 'the teacher not being a specialist on the instrument being taught.' Subjects were also asked to recall a single lesson that they remember being particularly effective for them as a student. Salient elements of these lessons included: teacher demonstrations, focus on technique, and focus on tone. Overall more performance skills were considered important for higher ed than for school teaching.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Paul, S. J. (1998)	*N*=3, undergraduate instrumental music education students who had completed a two-year peer-teaching laboratory U of Oklahoma	Based on symbolic interaction theory, sociological, constructivist approach (Mead – see note 3)… *'gestures'* – behaviors and attitudes that define one as a member of a group (p. 74) *'internalizing a role'* – one has taken on a role (p. 74) *'reference group'* – groups one greatly wants to join (p. 74) *'significant others'* – those who exert a strong influence on our decisions regarding group membership Investigating the influence of peer-teaching laboratory experience on the development of teacher role identity.	Qualitative interview methodology Researcher used student videos to frame questions Based questions also on four categories of professional role development (Carper): a) ownership of occupational title and identity; b) Commitment to professional tasks and knowledge; c) Institutional position and reference group identification; d) recognition of social position	Selected findings: Students were concerned about demonstrating poor musicianship in front of their peers. Much of the identity information presented in this study does not specifically address a sense of conflict between teacher and musician roles. However, the theoretical foundation is very strong.
Roberts, B. A. (1991)	*N*=108 Canadian undergraduate music education students from five universities	Musician identity as a social construction (Berger & Luckmann; Hargreaves) Problem: What do music education students consider to be a 'musician' and how does this effect the social construction of their identity?	Grounded theory: Participant observation and open-ended interviews over a 36 month period	General findings: Music teachers seem to be more concerned with being a musician than science teachers are with being a scientist. Music teachers' role development may be suppressed by students' desires to affirm a performer identity. Development may also be suppressed by the social reward systems/pressures found in universities. We may act/overcompensate to legitimize a role that we feel needs support. In other words, music educators may overcompensate if they feel their musician identity is being threatened by focusing more effort on performing, practicing, etc. Most students considered their professional identity to be a performer (e.g., singer, player) rather than educator or music academic. When asked what they are studying in school most reply their main instrument… especially singers. Those who are less successful as performers claim the status of 'musician.' Status and prestige in the university is mostly gained through performing.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Roberts, B. (2004)	Based on review of research and author's own research program.	Discussing the social identity construction of the music teacher. McCall & Simmons definition of identity (p. 6) Becker *Culture of a Deviant Group* – musicians as deviants Suggests musician status engulfs music teacher identity – believes music education students want to be labeled as musicians – unfortunately this may require that students disassociate themselves from music ed to sustain their musician needs – music educators seek the prestige symbols acquired through performance… …unfortunately teachers often do not receive support for their musician identity in school settings… …this creates personal distress when music teachers try to support their musician identities without receiving ratification from others	Paper is a reduction of a lecture presented by the researcher. It is therefore in a casual, conversational style. Calls for more observational/naturalistic research	Some salient issues: It is possible to have more than one identity (e.g., pivotal vs. secondary identities)… Music school an interesting environment – often physically and sociologically isolated from the rest of the university… Music ed majors a socially bonded sub-group although with overlapping boundaries into other groups… Characteristics of the "music school:" a) performance majors thought to be the best by definition; b) music ed majors often geographically isolated from performers; c) music ed majors and other relatively academic majors (e.g., theory, musicology) often not thought of as serious musicians; d) grades do little for student status; e) classical music does more for status than pop/rock/jazz idioms; e) some students may be systematically excluded from certain ensembles, especially at high levels; f) status also varies by reputation of private teacher; g) reward systems skewed towards performers (e.g., scholarship and awards, entrance criteria, access to guest faculty, access to building resources) Makes a distinction between performer and musician (e.g., someone who knows music)… Identity development requires ratification/recognition by significant others... Performance recital seen as last "rite of passage" for music ed student… Suggests that music teacher identity is at best a neutral component of music education students' identity development and more often a negative factor… Believes students should see themselves as teacher first and musician second although wants to keep both identities alive…

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Rohwer, D., & Henry, W. (2004)	N=426 (52% response rate of original 798 randomly selected possible participants) professors listed in The College Music Society Directory showing a music education affiliation Choral area (n=110), instrumental area (n=196), and general area (n=120) An additional 10 non-respondents contacted by phone to compare their responses to those of volunteer responses – no differences found but comparisons include cell sizes of 10 and 416…	Relevant purposes: …to describe collegiate music educators' perceptions concerning the skills and characteristics needed to be an effective music teacher …to compare collegiate music educators' perceptions concerning the skills and characteristics needed to be an effective music teacher across teaching areas	Mixed-methodology: Quantitative survey with additional open-ended questions 27 likert-items requiring subjects to rate musical skills, 18 items regarding teaching skills, 24 items regarding personality characteristics and 23 open-ended questions (5-point?, strongly agree to strongly disagree) [item stems not specified for any of the categories] Reliability – internal consistency: Music items, r=.95 Teaching skills, r=.94 Personality characteristics, r=.98 …but reliability based on 10 cases?	Selected results: Ratings for all skill/characteristic categories ranged from M=3.86 to 4.77, in other words all were highly valued. In addition, standard deviations ranged from SD=.43 to .81 showing a lack of variability in responses. Rank order of skills and characteristics: 1 – Teaching skills rated highest 2 – Personality characteristics 3 – Musical skills (differences among categories very small – see narrow ranges described above) Highest rated specific items: Teaching – classroom management Personality – Ability to motivate Musical – Being musically expressive Differences only found on musical skill ratings by teaching area… …choral (M=4.44), instrumental (M=4.33), and general (M=4.15) – each area significantly different. Overall, musical skills are valued just slightly less in comparison to teaching skills and personality characteristics.
Sogin, D. & Wang, C. (2002)	n=15 expert teachers, n=36 non-expert teachers – see Results, paragraph two for a demographic description of each group. Expert teacher status estimated from demographic data (e.g., name, gender, age, current teaching position, total years of teaching, highest degree earned, graduate study beyond last degree, and specialized teacher training completed). This information was then used to compute an expert teacher rating on a scale from 0 to 5 (the specific equation used is not clearly described).	Purpose: ...to explore the factors associated with expertise in music teaching… …also to compare beliefs of expert and novice teachers. Study drew from previous work in teacher effectiveness ratings by Good and Brophy (1986), Emmer and Evertson (1994), Barr (1958), and Flanders (1965)	Mixed-methodology survey: Forced-choice, rank order, and open-ended questionnaire items.	Selected results: Responses to the open-ended question "Explain how you involve your students in values, experiences, insights, imagination, and appreciation through your own teaching" indicated that approximately one third of all participants believed that that a teachers ability model and valuing high-quality music were important. Note: …this is an online article and I could not access the tables.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Taebel, D. K. (1980)	*N*=204, 74% return rate Choral area (*n*=34), instrumental area (*n*=92), and general area (*n*=72), unspecified (*n*=3) Elementary (*n*=89), secondary (*n*=43), elementary and secondary (*n*=49), middle school (*n*=14), other/unspecified (*n*=6)	Drawing from competency based education movement – 1970's Purpose: …to develop a list of music teaching competencies and to rank them according to the views of music teachers. …to compare ratings of competencies by teaching area (e.g., choral, instrumental, general)	Quantitative survey Competencies rated on a six-point scale (0-'not used' to 6-'essential to learning') Musical competency categories (51 items): Aural skills, conducting skills, vocal skills, analytic/composition skills, knowledge of history, literature and teaching materials, skills in dance and movement, and primary performance medium skills Teaching competency categories (59 items): Planning, methods and techniques, instructional materials and equipment, communication skills, pupil evaluation and feedback, program and teacher evaluation, professional responsibilities, and control and management skills	Selected results: Aural skills (e.g., error detection) rated as the highest musical competency category. 'Professional enthusiasm,' 'clarity of instructions,' ' among the highest ranked teaching competencies. In general, teaching competencies rated higher than musical competencies. 46 teaching competencies received ratings greater than 4.00 whereas only 21 musical competencies received ratings greater than 4.00. In contrast, only 3.00 teaching competencies received ratings lower than 3 whereas 11 musical competencies received ratings lower than 3.00. The higher rated items tended to be ranked similarly across teaching areas whereas the lower rated items tended to differ across teaching areas. Teaching competencies were rated more similarly across teaching areas than musical competencies. Author calls for research connecting perceived competencies to observed teaching.
Teachout, D. J. (1997)	*n*=35 pre-service teachers (randomly selected from a larger pool of 98), *n*=35 experienced teachers (randomly selected from a larger pool of 78) Pre-service teachers from five universities Experienced teachers graduates or current graduate students from Kent St. University	Purpose: …to compare the responses of pre-service teachers and experienced teachers when asked, "What skills and behaviors are important to successful music teaching in the first 3 years of experience?"	Quantitative survey 40-item questionnaire – skills and behaviors rated on four-point likert scale (1-'somwhat important' to 4-'extremely important') Skills and behaviors grouped into three categories by the researcher: a) personal skills; b) musical skills; and c) teaching skills	Selected Results: Both groups rated musical skills significantly lower than both personal skills and teaching skills. Pre-service teacher mean ratings: Musical skills (*M*=3.14) Personal skills (*M*=3.48) Teaching skills (*M*=3.46) Experienced teacher mean ratings Musical skills (*M*=2.80) Personal skills (*M*=3.31) Teaching skills (*M*=3.32)

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Wayman, V. (2005, Feb.)	*n*=55 undergraduate music ed majors in an Introduction to Music Education course, *n*=25 music student teachers (all subjects from the same Southwestern university)	Modified replication of Teachout (1997-see above) Purpose: …to compare the responses of students in their first music education course to those of preservice teachers in student teaching assignments to the question, "What skills and behaviors are important to successful music teaching in the first 3 years of experience?"	Same measure and categorizations of items as Teachout (1997-see above)	Selected Results: Both groups rated musical skills significantly lower than both personal skills and teaching skills. 1st year music ed student mean ratings: Musical skills (*M*=2.83) Personal skills (*M*=3.39) Teaching skills (*M*=3.35) Student teacher mean ratings Musical skills (*M*=2.88) Personal skills (*M*=3.38) Teaching skills (*M*=3.36)
Woodford, P. G. (2002)	See chapter in New Handbook… (Colwell & Richardson, 2002)			
Teacher Identity in Music Education (TIME) Project See website - http://www.roehampton.ac.uk/cirme/TIME/index.asp#Latest Newsletter 1				
Teacher Identity in Music Education (TIME) Project See website - http://www.roehampton.ac.uk/cirme/TIME/index.asp#Latest Newsletter 2				
Teacher Identity in Music Education (TIME) Project See website - http://www.roehampton.ac.uk/cirme/TIME/index.asp#Latest Power Point of Final Results				

References/Bibliography
SMTE Preservice Music Teacher SAG – Miksza – 2005/06
Musician/Performer Role Conflict

Articles and Book Chapters *(see literature table for more information)*

*Barresi, A. (1980). The artist and educator controversy. *Dialogue in Instrumental Music Education, 4*(2), 48-59.

*Beynon, C. (1998). From music student to music teacher: Negotiating an identity, *Studies in music, 17,* 83-105.

Bernard, R. (2004). A dissonant duet: Discussions of music making and music teaching. *Music Education Research, 6*(3), 281-298.

Bouij,C. (1998). Swedish music teachers in training and professional life. *International Journal of Music Education, 32,* 23-30.

Bouij, C. (2004). Two theoretical perspectives on the socialization of music teachers. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 3*(3), (December 2004). http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/v3/Bouij04.pdf

Brand, M. (1988). Towards a better understanding of undergraduate music education majors: Perry's perspective. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 98,* 22-31.

Conkling, S. (2004). Music teacher practice and identity in professional development partnerships. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education. 3*(3), (December 2004). http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/v3/Conkling04.pdf

Frierson-Campbell, C. (2004). Professional need and the contexts of in-service music teacher identity. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 3*(3), (December 2004). http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/v3/Frierson04.pdf

Froehlich, H., & L'roy, D. (1985). An investigation of occupancy identity in undergraduate music education majors. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education bulletin, 85,* 65-75.

Hedden, S. K. (1973). Meaning of the concept of music teacher to high school musicians. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 21*(4), 366-371.

Henry, M. L. (2005). An analysis of certification practices for music education in the fifty states. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 14*(2), 47-61.

*Leonard, C. (1982). Music teacher education in the United States. In Colwell, R. (Ed.) (1982). *Symposium in Music Education.* Urbana, IL: University of Illinois.

Mark, D. (1998). The music teacher's dilemma – musician or teacher? *International Journal of Music Education, 32,* 3-23.

Mills, J. (2004). Working in music: Becoming a performer-teacher. *Music Education Research, 6*(3), 245-261.

Mills, J. & Smith, J. (2003). Teacher's beliefs about effective instrumental teaching in schools and higher education. *British Journal of Music Education, 20*(1), 5-28.

Paul, S. J. (1998). The effects of peer teaching experiences on the professional teacher role development of undergraduate instrumental music education majors. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education,* 73-92.

Roberts, B. A. (1991). Music teacher education as identity construction. *International Journal of Music Education, 18,* 30-39.

Roberts, B. (2004). Who's in the mirror? Issues surrounding the identity construction of music educators. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 3*(2), (July 2004).
http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/v3/Roberts04.pdf

Rohwer, D., & Henry, W. (2004). University teachers' perceptions of requisite skills and characteristics of effective music teachers. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 13*(2), 18-27.

Sogin, D. & Wang, C. (2002). An exploratory study of music teachers' perception of factors associated with expertise in music teaching. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 12(1).* 444-456.

Taebel, D. K. (1980). Public school music teachers' perceptions of the effect of certain competencies on pupil learning. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 28,* 185-197.

Teachout, D. J. (1997). Pre-service and experiences teachers' opinions of skills and behaviors important to successful music teaching. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 45,* 41-50.

Wayman, V. (2005, Feb.). *Beginning music education students' and student teachers' opinions of skills and behaviors important to successful music teaching.* Presented at the Desert Skies Symposium on Research in Music Education, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona.

Woodford, P. G. (2002). The social construction of music teacher identity in undergraduate music education majors (pp. 675-694). In Colwell R., & Richardson, C. (Eds.) (2002). *The New Handbook of Research on Music Teaching and Learning.* NY: Oxford University Press.

Teacher Identity in Music Education (TIME) Project
See website - http://www.roehampton.ac.uk/cirme/TIME/index.asp#Latest

       Newsletter 1
       Newsletter 2
       Power Point of Final Results

Dissertations (I did not review these)

L'Roy, D. (1983). The development of occupational identity in undergraduate music education majors (Doctoral dissertation, University of North Texas). *Dissertation Abstracts International, 44*(08A), 2401.

Prescesky, R. E. (1997). A study of preservice music education students: Their struggle to establish a professional identity. *Doctoral Dissertation,* McGill University, Canada.

Roberts, B. A. (1990). The social construction of "musician" identity in music education students in Canadian universities. *Doctoral Dissertation,* Stirling University, Canada.

Wilson, L. E. (1998). The experiences of music teacher/performers in public schools. *Doctoral Dissertation,* New York University.

White, D. B. (1996). From performer-musician to teacher-musician. *Unpublished Master's Thesis,* University of Victoria, British Columbia, Canada.

NOTE: * = I could not locate the article

SMTE Preservice Music Teacher SAG – Miksza – 2005/06
Musician/Performer Role Conflict

Considerations?

- What should serve as an operational definition of 'identity' – what should be the conceptual/theoretical basis of future studies (e.g., Roberts; McCall & Simmons; etc.)?

- Consider the work of Bouij/Sweden and the TIME/UK project so that complimentary data from the US could be gathered and meaningfully compared.

- If it is decided that a music teacher should be a good musician then what definition of musician or set of musical skills would that entail? Consider Teachout (1997) and Taebel (1980) for previously designed measures…

- Consider differences in the value of musical skills by teaching area (e.g., general, choral, instrumental).

- Consider the importance of music performance activity outside of school for job satisfaction.

Research Ideas?

- Given the prevalence of qualitative studies it seems that it may be worthwhile to supplement existing findings by collecting data from a larger number of subjects through quantitative means…

- Empirically test the Bouij model with questionnaire data from the US (possibly employ factor analytic or multi-dimensional data analysis techniques).

- Track teachers who are categorized by each 'Bouij-Type' and compare their effectiveness…

- Investigate how public school students perceive music teachers…

- Design a study to compare the identity development of pre-service music teachers to pre-service teachers in math/science/English/etc. (e.g., musician vs. music teacher; scientist vs. science teacher)

- Investigate the attitudes/beliefs of excellent high school musicians who decide to become teachers in fields other than music…

- Investigate the importance of teaching experience gained by pre-service music teachers when still in high school (section leader, drum major, etc.)…

- Specifically examine the extent to which performance/musical activity outside of school contributes to job satisfaction.

Notable Quote

"As a result of a long series of compromises, the present music teacher education program results in a human product whom the applied music specialist considers less than adequate as a performer, whom the musicologist considers deficient as a musical scholar, whom the theorist views as lacking in basic musical skills, and whom the school administrator unprepared to relate to music to the total school program. The graduate himself is placed in the unenviable position of having tried to please everybody and having pleased nobody (Leonard, p. 245, 1982)."

Literature Table
SMTE Preservice Music Teacher SAG
Teacher/School Personnel Role-Related Tension & Job Satisfaction (Scheib)

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Bacharach, Bamberger, & Mitchell (1990)	2,247 elementary and secondary school teachers within 83 school districts	The relationship between role conflict/role ambiguity and four sets of work design variables: supervision, job structuring, organizational career development, and classroom environment.	Quantitative survey	Found a distinct difference between elementary and secondary school staff. While elementary school personnel's role stress was more influenced by classroom environment factors, secondary school staff were more affected by supervisory issues. Found that "the more bureaucratically structured the job, the lower the reported level of role conflict and ambiguity" (p. 428). As they note, this is inconsistent with the popular view of professionalism in teaching and current reform movements where it is believed that teachers desire more freedom, control, and autonomy. They suggest that bureaucracy, in the face of complex job situations, is important, and in good measure very helpful. As a result of their findings, they warn against 'blanket' policies that do not take into effect the intricacies of different grade levels, schools, and classrooms. Since role conflict and role ambiguity have been shown to exist independently of each other, and are often a due to different issues, any plan to resolve these tensions needs to take this into account.
Bartlett (2004)	12 high school English teachers 14 high school humanities teachers	Illuminates the tensions between the rhetoric and presumed rewards of an expanded conception of teachers' work and the work demands and strains introduced by such a conception.	Qualitative inquiry including 18 months worth of data from 24-hour time and task diaries recorded by the subjects, ethnographic interviews, and observations.	This paper suggests that teacher overwork is, in part, a result of the expansion of teacher work roles. The argument unfolds in three parts. First, teachers' work roles have been expanded but structural supports for the expansion have been uneven. Second, the nature and extent of organizational support influences teacher experience of role expansion and, finally, teachers who embrace the expanded role conception strive to sustain it even in the absence of organizational supports. This results in overwork: here overwork is taken to mean working beyond the contractual day, week and year. Teachers' contracts specify their working day; when they work beyond this time without pay, then they are overworking. Current explanations of overwork do not adequately account for the case of teachers' overwork.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Billingsley & Cross (1992)	463 special education teachers 493 general education teachers	Examine predictors of commitment, job satisfaction, and intent to stay in teaching.	Quantitative survey: Role conflict and role ambiguity were assessed using the role questionnaire developed by Rizzo et al. (1970). Role conflict (Rolecon) was measured by six items such as, "I have to do things that should be done differently," and "I receive incompatible requests from two or more people." Role ambiguity (Roleamb) was measured by seven additional items such as, "I know exactly what is expected of me," and "clear, planned goals exist for my job." A 6-point response scale was used, ranging from (1) never true of one's job to (6) always true of one's job.	Work-related variables, such as role conflict and role ambiguity, were the best predictors.
Burke & Greenglass (1995)	362 teachers and administrators employed by the same school board.	Work stressors (from Cherniss (1980))	Quantitative survey	Found role conflict and role ambiguity to be "significantly and independently correlated with emotional exhaustion" (p. 194).
Byrne (1999)	NA – lit review	Teacher burnout	NA	Role conflict as it relates to teacher burnout: 1. Quantity of work to be done and quality of work realistically possible within time constraints. 2. Meeting the demands of overly large classes comprising students of diverse ability levels and meeting the needs of individual students. 3. Taking positive action in resolving student disciplinary problems and coping with negative or neutral support from administrators and parents (p. 22). Role ambiguity in the teacher's professional life: 1. Unclear and inconsistent policies regarding student behavior. 2. Required restructuring of curricula and pedagogical approaches in accordance with changing government mandates. 3. The perception of being held in low esteem by students, parents, administrators, and the general public (p. 22).

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Capel (1992)	405 middle school, high school, and college teachers in one Local Education Authority in England	Role stress & burnout factors	Quantitative survey – multiple regression analyses	Found that although stress and burnout were relatively low, individual (e.g., personality), environmental (e.g., workload), and psychological (e.g., role conflict, role ambiguity) variables significantly contributed to the stress of the teachers. Role conflict, in particular was found to be a significant predictor of anxiety and stress.
Conley & Woosley (2000)	371 elementary and secondary teachers	Role ambiguity, conflict, and overload and their relationship to two individually and organizationally related values and how teachers moderated stresses.	Quantitative survey? (could not locate entire document – abstract does not indicate)	Organizational commitment is affected by role stress. Teaming might increase role ambiguity.
Crane & Iwanicki (1986)	443 urban special education teachers	Role conflict, role ambiguity, and burnout	Quantitative survey	Role conflict and ambiguity explained a significant amount of variance in feelings of emotional exhaustion and depersonalization. While perceived burnout among teachers was moderate, the level varied significantly with respect to age, experience, sex, and setting.
Duke (1988)	4 'exceptional' principals	Job (dis)satisfaction	Qualitative interviews	Although all four subjects were found to have considerable job satisfaction, they were al also (surprisingly) planning on quitting. Their dissatisfaction with school policies, other administrative personnel, and limited professional growth opportunities resulted in role conflicts that could not be resolved to their satisfaction.
Esteve (1989)	NA	NA	NA	Esteve (1989) states: ... teachers are often faced with the situation of having to combine various roles, roles which are contradictory and which demand that they maintain an extremely precarious balance between various positions. Thus, we find that society demands that teachers play variously the role of friend, colleague, companion and helper in general in the development of the student, a position which is incompatible with the role of selector and evaluator which has also been entrusted to them. . . . Another frequent contradiction that helps to further the discomfort felt by many teachers is when they work within an institution where they are in disagreement on personal grounds with the form in which it functions or with the values therein encouraged, especially since, when meeting parents and students, the teacher is considered to be a representative of the institution (p. 11).

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Gordon (2000)	4 music teachers (an elementary general music teacher, a secondary choral teacher, a secondary band teacher, and an orchestra teacher of grades 5-12)	Occupational stress	Qualitative case study (but mostly just interviews (3 one hour interviews each participant)).	Placed the stressors into three categories: *1. Behaviors and attitudes* -The constancy of discipline. -Irritable, negative, or uncooperative students, teachers, or parents. -Student apathy; and district attitudes toward school music programs. *2. Difficulties of managing music programs in the schools* -Lack of general school organization which impacts the management of the music program. -Lack of or inconsistency with administrative policies. -School politics. -The large number of students served in the program. -The demands of paperwork and nonmusical tasks -Inadequate budgets for purchasing and maintaining equipment, music, instruments, and materials. -Inadequate facilities. -Serving two or more schools. -Extended teaching hours beyond the school day. -The amount of required work in relation to the allotted time to complete the work. *3. Insufficient preparation for music teaching* -Unsuccessful lessons. -Lack of knowledge and skill in curriculum design. -Inadequate or incomplete pedagogical and methodological preparation. -Absence of skill and knowledge in classroom management and discipline. -Insufficient knowledge of literature and particular instruments (pp. 37-38). Recommendations: 1. Improved professional preparation of educators. 2. Time management in the schools. 3. Alleviate stress by more total faculty involvement in decision-making and by incorporating medical community.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Grace (1972)	Numerous studies with British teachers	Role conflict, values conflict	NA	Found that male teachers specifically had role conflicts between their desire for personal career advancement and their commitment to their existing teaching position; in order to advance in their profession, they needed to leave their existing teaching position. This was a conflict because they believed what was best for their students was not necessarily best for them professionally. Another conflict arose from the respondents of this study regarding the teacher's values and the perceived values of others:
Gross, Mason, & McEachern(1958)	105 school superintendents 517 members of their boards of education	Definition of roles, role sending, division of responsibilities in decision making and executive functions	Quantitative interviews and questionnaires	Found that the more homogenous the grouping of people, the more consensus they had in defining roles and expectations. The researchers found that superintendents as a whole had a greater consensus among them than did the board members. Board members who shared common backgrounds (religion, politics, education, etc.) were more likely to agree with each other; but superintendents that shared similar backgrounds with certain board members did not agree with them as much as they did with other superintendents. They attributed this to an organizational-role system rather than a personal-status construct.
Haney & Long (1989)	70 elementary and secondary school physical education teachers. 70 'other teachers' (e.g., regular classroom teachers)	Role stress	Quantitative survey - multiple regression analysis	Found that role overload was the best predictor of health concerns for these teachers. Teachers who experienced high role overload had more concerns about their health than teachers who experienced lower role overload.
Heston et al. (1996)	120 Midwestern public school band directors	Job satisfaction and occupational stress.	Quantitative survey in which subjects were asked to rank-order 10 factors according to their contribution to the directors' sense of job satisfaction, and 10 factors on the degree of stress they experienced in conjunction with these factors.	Found that the three most stressful variables reported were negative student attitudes, inappropriate student behaviors, and teaching load. Although the researchers did not look at role stress, we can see a possible correlation. The stress reported as coming from negative student attitudes and behavior could be described as a person-role conflict: the teacher's beliefs conflict with the attitudes/behavior of the students. This stress could also be a result of role ambiguity (teacher not comfortable with role as disciplinarian, authority figure, etc.), underutilization of skills (teacher not believing student motivation or management is the best use of their skills), or resource inadequacy (not sufficient time or resources to effectively manage students). The variable of teaching load can be best equated with a feeling of role overload.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Hoffer (1982)	118 music teachers in Indiana	Attitudes towards value of school music	Quantitative attitudinal survey (5 point Likert scale)	Found: 1) teachers felt strongly about the worth of music education in the schools. 2) society at large did not share their view. 3) secondary school teachers particularly felt they were "more in the business of entertainment than education". 4) poor salaries – do not reflect amount of skill and time required. 5) 50% report to feeling they DID NOT make the right decision to pursue music education as a profession.
Jenkins & Calhoun (1991)	124 female public school teachers	Managing occupational stress.	Experimental? (could not locate entire document, but abstract states the researchers "assigned female teachers to either individualized training method or global approach training method."	Found that the first and second most frequently reported stressor at work (and at home) was role overload related. The subjects of the study reported "work overload" as the top cause of stress, and "pressure" (too many pressures or demands) as the second. Individual training participants did significantly increase time spent on managing stress.
Krueger (2000)	30 music teachers	Factors influential to job dissatisfaction.	Qualitative interviews (3 one hour interviews each)	Factors influential to job dissatisfaction: 1. Insufficient administrative support – teacher morale, classroom discipline, music education advocacy. 2. Isolation from other music staff – lack of support network. 3. Itinerant teaching positions – demanding and overloaded schedules. 4. Lack of job security – layoffs due to inadequate financial support. 5. Insufficient resources and facilities – lack of funding.
Locke & Massengale (1978)	201 teacher-coaches	Teacher-coach role conflict & role overload	Quantitative survey	Found that role conflict and role overload tensions were higher for coaches who were employed in physical education than those who were academic teachers.
Lutz & Maddirala (1990)	700 Texas teachers	Effect of certain Texas reform policies on teacher burnout.	Quantitative questionnaires for all 700 subjects, follow-up telephone interviews with 120 of the respondents.	Excessive paperwork, due to mandates and reform movements, was a significant factor in the emotional exhaustion of the respondents. The researchers also concluded that the teachers were becoming more apt to teach "to the test" in their classrooms due to mandated testing as well as the overwhelming working conditions (i.e., overload).

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Nimmo (1986)	396 music teachers who had left the high school band directing profession	Profile of school band directors who have left the profession.	Researcher-generated quantitative questionnaire and the Maslach Burnout Inventory	<u>Primary causes for their quitting:</u> 1. Insufficient salary. 2. Unappreciative administration. 3. Too many school-related evening commitments. 4. Too many athletic commitments for the pep band. 5. A feeling of not being able to spend enough time with family. 6. A feeling that 'nobody cares'. 7. A desire to do something different. 8. A general feeling of being 'burned out'. <u>Suggestions and comments about their quitting:</u> 1. too much of everything is expected 2. band directors need a sound philosophy of music education 3. college preparation courses need improvement 4. merit pay is essential 5. band directors must be skilled in human relations 6. assistants are essential 7. band directors must have a realistic view of the profession
Russell (1998)	114 Wisconsin school directors of curriculum & instruction	Role conflict and role ambiguity	Quantitative survey: 36-item questionnaire, respondents indicated the extent their curriculum and instruction director ideally should have responsibility for each item, and their actual level of responsibility. Curriculum directors also completed a 14-item role conflict and role ambiguity instrument.	Found that the boundary position status of these administrators contributed to their moderately high levels of role conflict. Russell also noted that newer curriculum and instruction directors experienced more role conflict and role ambiguity than did veterans.
Scheib (2004)	8 school band teachers	Factors contributing to music teacher attrition	Qualitative email open-ended survey	Four general categories into which the responses fit: 1) difficult working conditions, 2) low salary, 3) low morale due to public rhetoric, and 4) low priority of music education within the school curriculum.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Scheib (2003)	4 high school music teachers (2 band teachers, 1 choir teacher, 1 orchestra teacher)	Role stress	Qualitative collective case study	Found issues of role conflicts, role overloads, underutilization of skills and resource inadequacy among the subjects. Among the issues for these teachers, they felt unduly burdened with insipid administrative tasks (resource inadequacy), had an overwhelming level of professional duties that impeded on their personal life (role conflict, role overload), and exhibited tension caused by the busy (and conflicting) schedules of their students (resource inadequacy).
Scheib (2002)	Same as above	Same as above	Same as above	Dissertation from where the above article was pulled. Included in the dissertation is more information on the specific roles, role senders, and role tensions exhibited by the subjects. In addition, thematic material uncovered relating to intensification of work and the devalued status of music teachers is discussed.
Scheib (in press)	NA – position paper	Conflicting ideologies between school music teachers and school administrators using a framework of Kliebard's (1995) identified four curricular visions for the 20th century as a 'lens' to view this conflict.	NA	Conflicting ideas on the purpose/direction of schooling and roles of teachers and administrators are explored. Music teacher stress in regards to a 'lack of administrator support' is examined through uncovering potential conflicts in ideologies. Music teachers, trained as both musicians and teachers, often hold humanist, developmentalist, and social meliorist views while administrators seem to focus on social efficiency.
Starnaman & Miller (1992)	880 education employees	Burnout and role stress.	Developed and tested a causal model of the relationship among burnout, communication, organizational stressors, and outcomes in the educational setting.	Results point to both quantitative and qualitative workload as strongly influencing burnout and role stress. Teachers' workload and support from their principal influenced role conflict and role ambiguity. Finds that these role stressors, in turn, influenced perceptions of burnout, job satisfaction, and occupational commitment.
Thompson, McNamara, & Hoyle (1997)	Synthesis of the first 26 volumes of 'Educational Administration Quarterly (EAQ)'	Job (dis)satisfaction in educational organizations.	14-stage model for quantitative synthesis was developed and validated to classify, recorded, and analyze study characteristics found in the synthesis population of EAQ articles.	Found that as role tension (e.g., role conflict, role ambiguity) *increased*, the overall job satisfaction of teachers and administrators *decreased*. However, the job satisfaction – role tension relationship is more significant for teachers than administrators, and "job task characteristics" contribute more to job dissatisfaction than to organizational or individual characteristics (e.g., age, gender).

References/Bibliography
SMTE Preservice Music Teacher SAG
Teacher/School Personnel Role-Related Tension & Job Satisfaction (Scheib)

Bacharach, S. B., Bamberger, P., & Mitchell, S. (1990). Work design, role conflict, and role ambiguity: The case of elementary and secondary schools. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 12*(4), 415-432.

Bartlett, L. (2004). Expanding teacher work roles: A resource for retention or a recipe for overwork? *Journal of Education Policy, 19(*5), 565-582.

Billingsley, B. S., & Cross, L. H. (1992). Predictors of commitment, job satisfaction, and intent to stay in teaching: A comparison of general and special educators. *Journal of Special Education, 25*(4), 453-471.

Burke, R. J., & Greenglass, E. (1995). A longitudinal study of psychological burnout in teachers. *Human Relations, 48*(2), 187-202.

Byrne, B. M. (1999). The nomological network of teacher burnout: A literature review and empirically validated model. In R. Vandenberghe & A. M. Huberman (Eds.), *Understanding and preventing teacher burnout: A sourcebook of international research and practice* (pp. 15-37). Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.

Capel, S. A. (1992). Stress and burnout in teachers. *European Journal of Teacher Education, 15*(3), 197-211.

Conley, S., & Woosley, S.A. (2000). Teacher role stress: Higher order needs and work outcomes. Journal of Educational Administration, 38(2), 179-201.

Crane, S. J., & Iwanicki, E. F. (1986). Perceived role conflict, role ambiguity, and burnout among special education teachers. *Remedial and Special Education (RASE), 7*(2), 24-31.

Duke, D. L. (1988). Why principals consider quitting. *Phi Delta Kappan, 70*(4), 308-312.

Esteve, J. (1989). Teacher burnout and teacher stress. In M. Cole & S. Walker (Eds.), *Teaching and stress*. Philadelphia: Open University Press.

Gordon, D. (2000). Sources of stress for the public school music teacher: Four case studies. *Contributions to Music Education, 27*(1), 27-40.

Grace, G. R. (1972). *Role conflict and the teacher*. Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Gross, N., Mason, W. S., & McEachern, A. W. (1958). *Explorations in role analysis: Studies of the school superintendency role*. New York: Wiley.

Haney, C. J., & Long, B. C. (1989). Role stress, coping effectiveness and health concerns of physical education teachers. *Educational Research Quarterly, 13*(4), 34-42.

Heston, M. L., Dedrick, C., Raschke, D., & Whitehead, J. (1996). Job satisfaction and stress among band directors. *Journal of Research in Music Education (JRME), 44*(4), 319-327.

Hoffer, C. R. (1982). Work related attitudes and problems of Indiana music teachers. *Psychology of Music, 10*(Special Issue), 59-62.

Jenkins, S., & Calhoun, J. (1991). Teacher stress: Issues and intervention. *Psychology in the Schools, 28*, 60-70.

Krueger, P. J. (2000). Beginning music teachers: Will they leave the profession? *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*(Fall/Winter 2000).

Locke, L. F., & Massengale, J. D. (1978). Role conflict in teacher/coaches. *The Research quarterly for Exercise and Sport, 49*, 162-174.

Lutz, F. W., & Maddirala, J. (1990). Stress, burnout in Texas teachers and reform mandated accountability. *Educational Research Quarterly, 14*(2), 10-21.

Nimmo, D. J. (1986). *Factors of attrition among high school band directors.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Arizona State University, Phoenix, AZ.

Russell, L. K. (1998). *Role conflict and role ambiguity related to the responsibilities of curriculum and instruction directors in Wisconsin public schools.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Wisconsin, Madison, WI.

Scheib, J.W. (2004). Why band directors leave: From the mouths of maestros. *Music Educators Journal, 91*(1), 53-57.

Scheib, J.W. (2003). Role stress in the professional life of the school music teacher: A collective case study. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 51*(2), 124-136.

Scheib, J.W. (2002). *Roles, expectations, and tension in the professional life of the school music teacher: A collective case study.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Wisconsin-Madison, Madison, WI.

Scheib, J.W. (in press). Tension in the life of the school music teacher: A conflict of ideologies. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education.*

Starnaman, S. M., & Miller, K. I. (1992). A test of a causal model of communication and burnout in the teaching profession. *Communication Education, 41*, 40-53.

Thompson, D. P., McNamara, J. F., & Hoyle, J. R. (1997). Job satisfaction in educational organizations: A synthesis of research findings. *Educational Administration Quarterly, 33*(1), 7-37.

Literature Table
SMTE Preservice Music Teacher SAG – Haston/Hourigan – 2005/06
Socialization/Best Practice in Music Education

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Broyles, J. (1997)	*N*=12 undergraduate music education student teachers; also involved 20 public school cooperating teachers and 8 university supervisors	Effects of videotape analysis on role development of student teachers	Qualitative: participant questionnaires, observation instruments completed by student teachers while viewing their videotapes, journals kept by student teachers, and questionnaires completed by cooperating teachers and university supervisors	Role development was evident, self-concern turned into pupil-learning concerns, occupational identity increased for most subjects (as identified by the Carper model), student teachers and cooperating teachers realized value of viewing videotapes, university supervisors reported strengthening of teacher identity and refinement of teaching skills
Wolfgang, R. (1990)	Could not find. "Early field experience in Music Education: A study of teacher role socialization" Univ. of Oregon DAI 52(01A), 137			
Ferguson, K. (2003)	*N*=4 undergraduates employed as teaching assistants in an after-school, University sponsored string project for 4th-10th graders; secondary participants were 3 additional part-time undergraduate TAs and 1 part-time GA	Early field experiences contribute to the development of teacher identity; How does participation in a String Project contribute?	Multiple case study with an ethnographic approach- observing classes and lessons, attending meetings, interviewing participants, collecting artifacts	How do undergraduates view their String Project experiences? Results filtered through personal histories; preferred large group vs. small group, confidence vs. lack of confidence (related to age group better) What understandings do the undergraduates gain about the process of becoming a teacher? Undergraduates valued the experience because it provided opportunities to test new information against individual perceptions; all valued process of receiving feedback about their teaching …this study can help teacher educators design field experiences that encourage preservice teachers to integrate rather than reject new ideas.
Conkling, S. (2003)	*N*=7, 5 undergraduate and 2 graduate pre-service music teachers who worked as a cohort at a PDS for one semester	Investigating professional growth of preservice music teachers (prior to student teaching) using reflective thinking	Collective case study; qualitative methodologies- field notes from observations, content analysis of participants' journals, transcription of unstructured interviews with participants	Participants unilaterally compared learning to teach with learning to perform, including influential models, sources of useful feedback, rehearsal strategies, and the ends toward which learning occurs; Who shall I be?—tested personal capacities for teaching, tried out various teaching personas, and found out whether or not they could manage all the facets of choral music teaching.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Campbell, M. (1999)	*N*=43 music education undergraduates in a teaching practicum, curriculum analysis class, and reflective teaching seminar	Much of music teacher education research has focused on product, not the process of how prospective music teachers become effective, knowledgeable, or acquire teacher dispositions.	Ethnographic inquiry-constructivist approach with all subjects (including the researcher) serving as participants, observers, and analyzers; mus ed undergraduates teaching elementary general music weekly	Teacher identity highly influenced by prior musical experiences; Performance-centered experiences (in high school and college) results in performance-centered philosophy; Images of themselves as constructors of musical knowledge are absent in their talk, replaced by images as "directors" and "givers of information and modelers of skills"; Conflict between what Emily initially thought she should be as a teacher and what she was being required to do as a teacher; "Teacher mode" is the way I view myself professionally and understand who I am, what my job entails, and how I decide what is most important in my teaching. It is a way of beginning to understand my profession" (as opposed to trying to "have fun with music" and "be friendly.")
Berg, M. (2004)	*N*=2, second-career music teachers (Might be interesting to consider second-career music teachers' identity development.)	Second-career music teaches bring different experiences and attitudes to teaching. Research is needed to compare their socialization process to that of first-career music teachers.	Qualitative-interviews, e-mail journals, observations.	Generally speaking, second-career music teachers face many of the same challenges as first-year music teachers (classroom management, personal health maintenance, scheduling), but had advantages as well (working with colleagues, multitasking)
Mitchell, B. (1997)		Lack of reflection and role identity in undergraduate music teacher education	Undergraduates maintained portfolios during their 4-year program.	Students reflected on teaching more often and more critically, and displayed greater enthusiasm for teaching and being a teacher.

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Prescesky, R. (1997)	Could not find. Dissertation. "A study of preservice music education students: Their struggle to establish a professional identity"			Abstract from DAI: "Discusses how music *education* students come to think of themselves as music educators, and explores four music *education* students' perceptions of themselves as musicians and as educators. Believing that self-perceptions are rooted in personal biographies, autobiographical and journal writings were investigated to establish links between participants' perceptions and biographies. Issues encountered by participants as they began to think of themselves as music educators were uncovered. Participants' perceptions of their "selves" were rooted in childhood memories and models of practice. They interpreted, internalized, and practiced the tacit expectations of their models of practice. Subsequently, participants' images of self-as-musicians and self-as-educators were connected by a common thread, that of image of self. Participants who viewed self-as-performer encountered conflict between their identities as musician and as educator. Other participants constructed images of self-as-participants. As such, they experienced a sense of unity and resonance between their identities as musicians and as educators. Issues directly related to their self-perceptions surfaced as participants began to think of themselves as music educators. The implication of these issues for teaching practice, and the relationship between these issues and preservice *teacher* training were considered. Includes a discussion of research implications and directions for reforming music *teacher education*."
Apfelstadt, H. (1996)	Could not locate. "Teacher education: A process of becoming"			Abstract from RILM: "Teaching is an evolutionary process; recognizing and accepting that the act of learning is also an ongoing process is germane to the field of *teacher education* and to the process of becoming an educator."

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Robbins, J. (1993)	Could not find. "Preparing students to think like teachers: Relocating our teacher education perspective"			Abstract from RILM: "Too often the preparation of *teachers* reflects the view that teaching is primarily linear, emphasizing *teacher* action rather than *teacher* judgment. Consequently, when students become *teachers*, they assume they should use the suggested activities or methods precisely as presented. The prescriptive nature of *teacher* preparation in music fails to address the uncertainties that typically accompany early classroom teaching experiences, which require decisions and judgment calls that *teachers* never imagined and for which they are unprepared. Suggestions for undergraduate music methods courses are given to address this, including journal keeping and the use of case studies"

Literature in General and Higher Education

Author (Date)	Subjects	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Methodology	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
Zeichner and Hoeft (1996) *Handbook of Research on Teacher Education*	N/A (Literature Review)	Addresses the issues of preservice teacher socialization for cultural diversity. Examines selection and socialization within programs and institutional change	Comprehensive Literature review in general teacher education on this topic.	- Limited research base - More incentives for teacher educators to write about their work - Encourage those who have the resources to study teacher education - Expand research to include other countries
Margolis, E. (ed.) (2001)	The Hidden Curriculum in Higher Education (book title)	Collection of chapters (based on research) that explore the pedagogical practices of higher education and how these practices promote socialization hierarchies based on race, gender, and class.	Comprehensive Literature review in general teacher education on this topic.	
Kuh et al. (2005)	Student Success in College: Creating Conditions that Matter (book title)	The purpose of this book is to document noteworthy performance practices in higher education	Documented institutional conditions that are important to student development.	Recommends the following factors contribute to student success in higher education: • Clear focused educational mission • High standards for student performance • Support for students to explore human differences and immerging dimensions • Emphasis on early months and first year of study • Respect for diverse talents • Integration of prior learning and experience • Ongoing practice of learned skills • Active learning • Assessment and feedback • Collaboration among students • Adequate time on task • Out-of-class contact with Faculty
Pascarella, E. T., & Terenzini, P. T. (2005)	How College Affects Students: A Third Decade of Research	Comprehensive literature review of research relating to impact theories and models relating to college effects.	Synthesis of research into the following categories: • College impact theory • Postsecondary learning and cognitive development • Personal growth and change • Socioeconomic attainment • Long term effect on quality of life	Recommends that educators in higher education should consider these components in developing curricula
Kain (1999)	Building the Sociological Imagination Through a Cumulative curriculum: Professional Socialization in Sociology	Examines the professional socialization of undergraduates through a research-based cumulative curriculum	Examined the curriculum of 40 Colleges and Universities	Recommends the following components of a strong undergraduate curriculum: • Include research to build imagination • Blur the line between classroom and outside world • Offer a capstone course that allows for students to work on projects that are research interests to them

References/Bibliography
Socialization/Best Practice in Music Education

Apfelstadt, H. (1996). Commentary: Teacher education – A Process of becoming. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 6*(1), 405.

Berg, M. (2004). An Investigation of second-career music teaching. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 14*(1), 10-19.

Broyles, J. W. (1997). *Effects of videotape analysis on role development of student teachers in music.* Doctoral Dissertation, The University of Oklahoma.

Campbell, M. (1999). Learning to teach music: A Collaborative ethnography. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education,* 139, 12-36.

Conkling, S. (2003). Uncovering preservice music teachers' reflective thinking: Making sense of learning to teach. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education,* 155, 11-23.

Ferguson, K. (2003). Becoming a string teacher. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education,* 157, 38-48.

Kain, E. L. (1999). Building the sociological imagination through a cumulative curriculum: Professional socialization in sociology. *Teaching Sociology, 27*(p. 1-16).

Kuh, G.D., Kinzie, J., Schuh, J. H., & Whitt, E.J. (2005). *Student success in college: Creating conditions that matter.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Margolis, E. (2001). *The hidden curriculum in higher education.* Independence KY: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.

Mitchell, B. S. (1997). Using portfolios in undergraduate music education. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 7*(1), 23-27.

Pascarella, E. T., & Terenzini, P. T. (2005). *How college affects students: A Third decade of research.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Prescesky, R. E. (1999). *A study of preservice music education students: Their struggle to establish a professional identity.* Doctoral Dissertation, McGill University.

Robbins, J. (1993). Preparing students to think like teachers: Relocating our teacher education perspective. *The quarterly journal of music teaching and learning,   IV*(1), 45-51.

Wolfgang, R. (1990). *Early field experience in Music Education: A study of teacher role socialization."* Doctoral Dissertation, University of Oregon.

Zeichner, K. M. & Hoeft, K. (1996). Teacher socialization for cultural diversity. In J. Sikula (Ed.), *Handbook of Research on Teacher Education (2nd ed.)* (pp. 525-547). New York: Macmillian

Literature Table
SMTE Preservice Music Teacher SAG – Raiber – 2005/06
Occupational Role Development

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Atkinson & Delamon, 1985)	Socialization into teaching: The research which lost its way *British Journal of Sociology of Education*	Occupational Socialization to teaching is a specific type of socialization that requires specific attention. Research must be focused on needs for effective teacher socializaton.		The paper argues that in recent years sociologist have neglected the processes of occupational socialization of teaching, despite research interest in everyday life in other educational settings. Shortcoming in the extant research on teacher socialization and the wider literature on professional socialization are detailed to explain the lack of intellectual interest in teacher socialization. Finally, the paper offers some potential lines for the development of research on teacher socialization.
(Biddle, Twyman, & Rankin, 1962)	The role of the teacher and occupational choice *The Social Review*	Role Theory	Subjects: Teacher Education Students, Students not in education Matched Samples Norms and expectations measured on a 50-point list of expectations of teachers.	If the images young persons hold for teaching are not realistic, the decisions they make about teaching will be unwise. Good potential teachers may be lost because the images they hold for teaching is harsh or unrewarding. Findings show that norms and expectations held by education students differ significantly from those of teachers and from non-education students, suggesting that socialization is taking place, but is not totally effective in socializing the education student to the role of teacher. Primary differences were that education students were more idealistic about student behavior. The differences between education students and teachers reveals a lack of accurate socialization to actual classroom culture and may suggest reasons why young teachers leave the profession in the first three years.

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Blau, Gustad, Parnes, & Wilcock, 1956)	Occupational Choice: A Conceptual Framework *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*	Theoretical Framework includes a) biological conditions, b) physical conditions and c) social structure that all have impact on young persons choice of career.		The many, varied factors influencing an individual's selection of an occupation are related in a conceptual framework in this article, which endeavors to tie together in a meaningful pattern the economic, psychological and sociological aspects of the process of job choice. The article does not present, however, a theory of occupational choice; rather, the purpose of the authors is to set up a systematic pattern for empirical research, out of which it may be possible at a future date to develop a theory. *In sum, occupational choice is restricted by lack of knowledge about existing opportunities; it does not necessarily involve conscious deliberation and weighting of alternatives; and in the polar case of complete indifference, no choice between occupations does in fact take place. Variation in knowledge, in rationality, and in discrimination between alternatives constitute, therefore, the limiting conditions within which individuals choose occupations by arriving at a compromise between their preferences and expectancies. This compromise is continually modified up to the time of actual entry, since each experience in the labor market affects the individual's expectations, and recurrent experiences may also affect his preferences.* Pg. 535

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Brownhill, 2006)	"Loosing Touch": Teachers on teaching and learning *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*	Social Role Theory	Qualitative • Semi-structured interview • Self-report	Teachers recruited to a cohort study in 1978 were interviewed to elicit their views on issues surrounding the education system and teaching profession. Qualitative data were derived from a semi-structured interview and quantitative data included a self-report measure of temperament and character. The findings highlight a "mismatch" between the characteristics or attributes of teachers and the shifting role of teachers to accommodate administrative and "social work" duties for which they have not been trained. This shift, in turn, takes them away from their core business of teaching. Furthermore, a common attribute of cooperativeness in this teaching cohort is more aligned with the teaching role that may explain teachers' frustration in having to accommodate an independent working style of administrator. Greater use of administrative support staff and counseling services to free teachers to do what they have been trained is more likely to reduce levels of work dissatisfaction. Mentoring of new graduates is more likely to buffer the stress as they make the transition from a learning to a teaching environment. A mentoring matrix is offered which features a bi-directional exchange of "tried and true ideas" of experienced teachers and "new ideas" of new graduates.

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Fredrickson, 1990)	How the Music Occupation Failed to Become a Profession *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music*	Symbolic Interaction framework		Although classical music is often referred to as a profession, it does not meet many of the criteria by which sociologies define the professions. The authors explain this contradiction through a historical analysis of the professionalism project of the music occupation. The music occupation succeeded at creating a new market for music, a new product, and new roles for the listener and the performer. The music occupation failed to become a profession, however, because it asserted its cultural authority on the basis of aesthetic values that lost their plausibility during an era which shifted to a new symbolic order based on scientific values. As a result, the music occupation might be best classified as a semi-profession. *The traits which are commonly agreed upon as characterizing professions include:* 1. *Possession of a specialized body of knowledge and techniques.* 2. *Establishment of standardized course of training for imparting is the specialized knowledge.* 3. *Testing applicants for knowledge and competence upon completion of training, followed by granting of licenses to practice.* 4. *Licensed practitioners therefore hold a legal occupational status which guarantees them a monopoly over their sector of the market.* 5. *Autonomy form direct supervision and the substitution of collegial control in place of hierarchical control. Pg. 190*

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Fredrickson, 1990) CONT.				*The music occupation created a market but failed to assert a monopoly over it. As a result, it became a semi-profession which retained elements of both service occupations and professions: informal codes of conduct, education but no formal credentials, structures to acquire status, and professional and service occupation definitions of music as a commodity (aesthetic and utilitarian functions). The failure of the music occupation's professionalization project helps to explain the contemporary confusion about music's uncertain status as a profession. Pg. 203*
(Frierson-Campbell, 2004)	Professional Need and the Contexts of In-Service Music Teacher Identity *Action, Criticism & theory for Music Education*	Qualitative "Mind Map" analysis of group discussions. Tables produced from comparison of individual maps to group maps. Tables include: • Music Teacher Priorities • Undergraduate course preparation • Areas needed for undergraduate preparation • Specific approaches for teaching music in an urban setting • Factors contributing to success as a music teacher in an urban setting Many findings suggest that role development is a key factor is teaching success in this environment.	Discusses at three-year grant funded project partnering universities with professional development schools. The final year of the project culminated in a formal needs assessment. The needs assessment was based on the question: "What is needed to take urban music education from where it is now to where it could be?"	*Those of us who are interested in the problem of music teacher identity are not the detached participant observers that our sociologist counterparts are. We bring to the table a vested interest not only in music teacher identity but also in the institution of school music education as a whole. The observations and interviews that comprise this research suggest that the conflict between the role of music education as perceived by schools and the ideals of music educators may be difficult to negotiate by any standards. For Becker's jazz musicians, understanding their (non-musician) employer's expectations for their performances was necessary because it helped them navigate their way to prestigious high-paying gigs. For school and collegiate music educators the stakes are also high. Our concern is ultimately not with the employer, but with the musical education of students. Pg.22*

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Kadushin, 1969)	The Professional Self-Concept of Music Students. *The American Journal of Sociology*	Multivariate analyses of students self-reported professional status across a number of variables. These include: • Classes taken • Professional Performances • Classification Findings indicate that membership in the upper classes in school, performance for pay, union membership, and an intention to teach catapult a student into an extremely high probability of a professional self-concept.	Students at Juilliard and Manhattan Schools of music were ask to rate themselves on a scale in an answer to the following question: We would like to know whether your think of yourself as a professional musician, a music student, or "part way" between these two. As a spur of moment judgment, where would you place your self on the scale below. Draw a line to indicate where you fall. Music Prof. Student Musician	As a result of their study of a medical school, Becker and his associates suggest that students in professional schools acquire only the self-concept of "student." In contrast, Merton and his associates, in their studies of medical and law schools, propose that students gradually acquire the self-concept of "professional." The issue is important to the theory of adult socialization. Music conservatories afford an excellent test case because music students engage in professional activities while they are still in school. Multivariate analyses of the effects of professional activity and the effects of the music school suggest that both accrual professional activity and the professional school itself contribute to the development of the professional self-concept. But the variables interact. Students who do not engage in "clinical" activities (professional work) do not generally acquire a high self-concept. Much of the effect of the music conservatories is not through direct social contact with teachers or students. Rather, students acquire musical skills which are the prerequisite for professional work and for symbolic rewards, both of which lead to a professional self-concept.

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Marsh, 1981)	Developing an Alternative Curriculum for Preservice Teachers: A Recent Evaluation Study *Education Evaluation and Policy Analysis*	To produce evaluation data that unequivocally demonstrate that attitudes are changed by involvement in a specific curriculum is extremely difficult. The data collected in this research project from a semantic differential, interviews, questionnaires and self report ratings revealed some widening of attitudes, all of which tended to support the hypothesis used in the program. The results were certainly encouraging in that two of the four concepts in the semantic differential indicated an increased role flexibility. Pg 74	Outline of a three-year curriculum in teacher education that is primarily focused on teacher socialization.	*Judging from the problems which beset beginning teachers when they embark upon their teaching carets, there are some major omissions in traditional teacher education programs. One omission is sufficient emphasis on socialization. The role of a teacher is a complex one, in which norms of behavior are far from explicit, status relationships are very significant yet not clearly defined, and total subculture of the school produces all kinds of hidden curriculum implications.* Pg. 67
(Mortimer, 1979)	Work experience and occupational value socialization: A longitudinal study. *The American Journal of Sociology*	A notable finding in this study is that occupational reward values are very predictive of work experiences 10 years later.	A factor analysis of three constructs: Income Work Content Work Autonomy	This research examines the effects of work experience on occupational reward values, which are of central importance in occupational choice, career development, and subjective responses to work. Whereas it is often assumed that occupational values remain fixed throughout the work history, a confirmatory factor analysis of data obtained from male college graduates over a ten-year time span demonstrates that work autonomy and income influence intrinsic, people-oriented, and extrinsic values, Rewarding occupational experiences were found to reinforce the same values that constituted the basis of earlier work selection. The findings raise several issues for study of social inequality.

Author Date	Article Title *Journal*	Conceptual/Theoretical Underpinning, Problem	Research Design	Results, Implications, Suggestions, Other
(Neal & Griffin, 2006)	A Model of Self-Held Work Roles and Role Transitions. *Human Performance*	A model based upon three interrelated components: Behavioral expectations Role Schemas Self Concept		System requirements are based on individuals' perceptions of the employing organization, and the demands that system makes of them. The role schema represents an important set of behavioral expectations that people bring with them when they enter an organization. People might therefore exhibit some surprise or anxiety when the requirements of their employing organization differ from the expectations within the role schema. Self-concept is a cognitive schema that filters, stores and organizes information about the self. Role holders may be quite eager to adjust their self-concept if the change moves them closer to an idealized possible self.
(Sachs & Smith, 1988)	Constructing Teacher Culture *British Journal of Sociology of Education*	Conflict theory is a primary theoretical foundation in this article.		In this paper, the argument is made that forms of consciousness, knowledge, sentiments and values that teachers use as part of their cultural repertoires is schools are the result of social construction. The "social" is composed of a number of overlapping discourses that are characteristic of schools everywhere. "Teacher culture" is a signifier for the production of consumption of these discourses. Recent trends to emphasize the plurality of teacher culture(s) are countered by a review of the work suggests more uniformity in teacher culture. There is a very good section on professional preparation and socialization.

Bibliography
Occupational Role Development

Atkinson, P., & Delamon, S. (1985). Socialization into teaching: The research which lost its way. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 6*(3), 307-322.

Becker, H. S.,& Carper, J. W. (1956). The Development of Identification with an Occupation. *The American Journal of Sociology, 61*(4), 289-298.

Biddle, B. J., Twyman, J. P., & Rankin, E. F. J. (1962). The role of the Teacher and Occupational Choice. *The Social Review, 70*(2), 191-206.

Blau, P. M., Gustad, J. W., Parnes, H. S., & Wilcock, R. C. (1956). Occupational Choice: A Conceptual Framework. *Industrial and Labor Relations Review, 9*(4), 531-543.

Brownhill, S. (2006). "Loosing Touch": Teachers on teaching and learning. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education, 34*(1), 5-26.

Fredrickson, J., & Rooney, J. F. (1990). How the Music Occupation Failed to Become a Profession. *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music, 21*(2), 189-206.

Frierson-Campbell, C. (2004). Professional Need and the Contexts of In-Service Music Teacher Identity [Electronic Version]. *Action, Criticism & theory for Music Education*, 3 from ACT Journal: http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/index.html.

Kadushin, C. (1969). The Professional Self-Concept of Music Students. *The American Journal of Sociology, 75*(3), 389-404.

Marsh, C., & Peers, J. (1981). Developing an Alternative Curriculum for Preservice Teachers: A Recent Evaluation Study. *Education Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 3*(3), 67-74.

Mortimer, J. T., & Lorence, J. (1979). Work experience and occupational value socialization: A longitudinal study. *The American Journal of Sociology, 84*(6), 1361-1385.

Neal, M., & Griffin, M. (2006). A Model of Self-Held Work Roles and Role Transitions. *Human Performance, 19*(1), 23-41.

Sachs, J., & Smith, R. (1988). Constructing Teacher Culture. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 9*(4), 423-436.

**Becoming a Music Teacher:
The Role of Reflective Practice
In Constructing a Music Teacher Identity**

*A Literature Review Synthesis and Annotated Bibliography
Submitted to the Society for Music Teacher Education
Preservice Teacher SAG
Salt Lake City, Utah
April, 2006*

Michael W. Moore, Ph.D.
Bob Jones University

Kristen A. Albert, Ed.D.
West Chester University of Pennsylvania

Literature Review Synthesis

The transition from music student to music teacher does not happen automatically; rather, it requires a concerted effort on the part of the faculty to change the students' perceptions of themselves (Beynon, 1998; Woodford, 2002). Moreover, the dual nature of a musician's role as performer and teacher may complicate the transition for undergraduate music education majors (Dolloff, 1999; Mark, 1998; Prescesky, 1997; Roberts, 1991).

Several researchers (Freese, 1999; Korthagen & Russell, 1999; Woodford, 2002; Zulich, Bean, & Herrick, 1992) suggest that developing candidates' reflective skills is essential for facilitating the transition from student to teacher. Rodgers (2002) maintains that Dewey's original conception of reflection has suffered a loss of meaning due to over-generalization and that it is difficult to evaluate reflective skills without a clear sense of what reflection, reflective practice, or reflective learning looks like. Based on the work of Dewey (1933), Schöen (1983), and Loughran (1994), Freese (1999) defines reflection "as the process of making sense of one's experiences by deliberately and actively examining one's thoughts and actions to arrive at new ways of understanding oneself as a teacher" (p. 898).

Preservice teachers, however, may fail to value reflection and reflective practice until confronted with a challenge or a problem in a teaching situation (Barry, 1994; Zielinski & Preston, 1992). King and Kitchener (1994, cited in Huba & Freed, 2002) posit that candidates progress through "seven stages of intellectual development from 'pre-reflective' thinking to 'quasi-reflective' thinking to 'reflective thinking'" (p. 213). Candidates in Stage One do not see a need to reflect; they report what they see and assume that what they have seen is true, that others would agree, and thus that there is no further need for explanation. By Stage Seven, however, candidates see the need for justification, understanding that others might see the same situation differently.

According to Kraus and Butler (2000), a preservice teacher's reflective disposition "must be fostered over a period of time and in a variety of situations." Dewey's work also points to the need for reflection to happen in a community, in interaction with others (Rodgers, 2002). Some propose that this process begin with a critical examination of the preservice teacher's assumptions regarding teaching and learning (Adler, 1990; Dolloff, 1999; Zulich, Bean, & Herrick, 1992). Korthagen and Russell (1999) suggest beginning with early, extended field-based experiences, thereby providing the preservice teacher with immediate opportunities to problematize and reflect on various teaching situations with guidance from a mentor/supervisor.

A number of researchers (Bolin, Khramtsova, & Saarnio, 2005; Carter, 1998; Gordinier, Moberly, & Conway, 2004; Freese, 1999; Kraus & Butler, 2000; Ross, 1989; Zulich, Bean, & Herrick, 1992) have addressed the role of reflective writing assignments (e.g., autobiography, dialogue journals, and theory-to-practice papers) in facilitating a preservice teacher's professional growth process. Huba and Freed (2000) cite developmental e-portfolio processes as beneficial to reflection. By engaging in reflective practice through e-portfolios, candidates can develop a view of themselves as learners, understand more deeply what they have and have not learned, develop a sense of learning as an ongoing process, develop a better understanding of how they learn and what they value, and see relationships among courses and in- and out-of-class learning experiences. Several other researchers (Galvez-Martin & Bowman, 1998; Greene & Campbell, 1993; Norton, 1994; Ross, 1990; Woodford, 2002) have emphasized the importance of providing guided practice, specific feedback, and modeling to assist the preservice teacher in developing reflective skills.

The traditional application-of-theory approach to teacher preparation may actually exacerbate the difficulty of music teacher identity construction for preservice music teachers by failing to provide adequate opportunities to reflect on and in real life teaching situations (Adler, 1990; Korthagen & Russell, 1999; Roberts, 1991; Woodford, 2002). Music teacher preparation

programs modeled after the Holmes Group Professional Development School concept incorporate reflective practice as a central component of the curriculum/practicum (e.g., Freese, 1999; Henry, 2001; Townsend, 2000) and therefore may hold promise regarding the problem of music teacher identity construction.

Though the efficacy of employing a reflective approach to teacher identity construction has been suggested in the teacher preparation research and opinion literature, it has yet to be directly substantiated through research in music teacher identity construction. The following questions may serve to guide researchers as they continue to explore and further define the relationship between reflective practice and music teacher identity construction.

- What characteristics are associated with candidates who display evidence of "teacher identity?" What are the characteristics of candidates who have achieved success in developing this identity?

- Does the pedagogical approach (e.g., traditional vs. reflective) of a music teacher preparation program affect the way undergraduate music education students view themselves professionally? How much of candidate learning can be attributed to pedagogical approach?

- How can directed/facilitated reflection within a community affect the construction of music teacher identity? What specific reflective strategies might best support the construction of a music teacher identity?

- In what pedagogical contexts of reflection have changes been observed? To what can these changes be attributed?

Annotated Bibliography

Organized by the following topics:
- Identity Construction
- Preservice Teacher Development and Stages of Concern
- Reflective Practice in Preservice Teacher Preparation Programs
- Strategies for Promoting Reflective Practice among Preservice Teachers
    - Reflective Journaling
    - Portfolios
    - Assessment of Student Reflections

Identity Construction

Beynon, C. (1998). From music student to music teacher: Negotiating an identity. In P. Woodford (Ed.), Critical thinking in music: Theory and practice [Monograph]. *Studies in Music from the University of Western Ontario,* 17 (pp. 83-105).

- *Unable to locate*

- According to Woodford (2002), Beynon took a proactive stance to guiding preservice teachers in developing their sense of professional identity through dialogical interviews (Woodford, p. 687).

Dolloff, L. A. (1999). Imagining ourselves as teachers: The development of teacher identity in music teacher education. *Music Education Research, 1*(2), 191-207.

- Music education methods courses typically do not address the issue of teacher role identity development. Dolloff suggests three strategies for uncovering preservice teachers' images of teachers and teaching: personal history/biography, using visual image metaphors, and drawing.

- Personal history/bio: "Giving students an opportunity to make their experience explicit allows students to reflect on what they believe about teaching" (p. 193).

- According to Knowles (1992), preservice teachers construct their teacher identity based on observation of other teachers and their own teaching experiences.

- Often preservice teachers' images of teachers are based on a private studio teacher. This image may be inappropriate for what is required of a classroom teacher. "This means that their image of the music teacher, and the teaching-learning interaction, is based on a model that will not necessarily work in the multi-student classroom" (p. 205).

- "When new teachers are faced with classroom realities they frequently shed their 'new and improved' models of teaching for those which are based on their experience as students. This frequently occurs in setting of peer teaching as well…. *I maintain that the discrepancy comes not from an unwillingness to experiment with new techniques, but from the newness of the teacher image as compared with the strong images of teaching and learning encountered in their own music education.* In other words, they are teaching

as they were taught. The new strategy is at odds with their memories of what a teacher 'does'" (p. 203-204, emphasis added).

Mark, D. (1998). The music teacher's dilemma: Musician or teacher? *International Journal of Music Education, 32,* 3-22.

- Mark reports on studies of Austrian music schools and the problem of preparing music teachers for the European labor market. Data was collected through interviews of approximately 400 musicians, professors, students, and graduates.

- Preservice music teachers may face a unique challenge in constructing a professional identity. Mark cites Abel-Struth (1985, p. 428): "'The specific tension between science and teaching, which complicates the teacher's role in general, is deepened in the case of the music teacher by the artistic claims and the multidimensional scientific aspects.' In addition, the understanding of the professional role of music teachers is somehow underdeveloped 'because it is burdened with expectations of a number of contradictory social and professional reference groups in the arts, sciences and pedagogical streams'" (p. 4).

- In the programs studied, the emphasis on developing musicianship was relatively great compared to the pedagogical components of the programs. This has led to a state of *Praxisschock* among some first-year teachers, which is "aggravated by the weight put on the musical artistic training by the teaching staff. The confrontation with the job reality often produces a kind of stress situation and frustration and many students do not feel well enough prepared for this step" (p. 13).

Prescesky, R. E. (1997). *A study of preservice music education students: Their struggle to establish a professional identity* (Doctoral dissertation, McGill University, 1997). *Dissertation Abstracts International, 59*(08A), 2898.

- Used autobiography and journal entries to explore identity construction of four music education students.

- From the DIA abstract (pp. 2898-2899):
    - "Participants' perceptions of their 'selves' were rooted in childhood memories and models of practice."
    - "Participants who viewed self-as-performer encountered conflict between their identities as musician and as educator."
    - "Other participants constructed images of self-as-participants. As such, they experienced a sense of unity and resonance between their identities as musicians and as educators."

Roberts, B. A. (1991). Music teacher education as identity construction. *International Journal of Music Education, 18,* 30-39.

- Roberts addresses the question of music education students' identity construction from a symbolic interactionist perspective. He seeks to form a grounded theory regarding music education students' identity construction through interviews with undergraduate music education majors (*n* = 108) and participant observation.

- Without exception, all interviewees saw themselves primarily as musicians; the role of teacher did not appear to hold great significance for the undergraduate music education majors – at least not as a wholly separate construct. The idea that all musicians are teachers of some sort, however, may be implicit in some students' constructed identities.

- This definitional fusion may, in fact, be unique to the field of music education; music education majors therefore may face a more problematic situation of identity construction than their counterparts in other academic disciplines. "[I]t is apparent that science or history teaching may perhaps be viewed more appropriately as informed by science or history studies but that music teaching may often be viewed as a function of a musician. . . . One cannot just borrow the knowledge about music as one might in science or history, one must, however, be a 'musician'" (p. 32).

- The social structure and environment prevalent in most schools of music may exacerbate the issue of identity construction for music education majors. The pressure to be viewed as a successful musician is a dominating influence and may leave little room in the students' thinking to pursue the identity of teacher.

- Students, in their desire to be accepted as musicians, often hold idealized views of themselves, regardless of reality. "[I]f this image in the mirror travels with the student beyond the borders of the music school, for instance into the classroom, perhaps there is cause for concern" (p. 35).

- "Thus it can be summarized that music education students typically view themselves as either a 'performer' on some specific instrument to which there appears to be a strong affiliation as a player, or as a general 'musician'. It further appears that this latter category is the perception of self for students who see themselves less able to compete for the 'performer' status. Despite the fact that all of these students are participating in a teacher education programme, their identity is squarely as a 'musician'" (p. 37).

Woodford, P. G. (2002). The social construction of music teacher identity in undergraduate music education majors. In R. Colwell & C. Richardson (Eds.), *The New Handbook of Research on Music Teaching and Learning* (pp. 675-694). New York: Oxford.

- Most undergraduates enter their formal training viewing themselves as musicians first and teachers second.

- A reflective or critical approach to music teacher preparation (as opposed to a traditional "transmission model") provides the necessary environment for encouraging preservice teachers to develop a professional identity as a music teacher.

- The transition from student to teacher does not happen automatically; rather, it requires a concerted effort on the part of the faculty to change the students' perceptions of themselves. (See Beynon, 1998).

- "[P]reservice music teachers require assistance in bridging the gap between university and school, theory and practice. . . . Their sense of professional identity emerged as they attempted to intellectually come to grips with those problems (p. 92). This would not have occurred at all, however, without Beynon's assistance in the form of dialogical interviews with interns. . . . Without her active and sustained involvement in engaging students to intellectualize about their own practice, these students, too, would have failed to appreciate that music teaching entails a unity of theory and practice (Woodford, p. 687)."

- "Music teacher educators are limited with respect to their direct influence on the public schools, but they can begin to address the problems of conservatism and intellectual passivity in music education majors *by integrating reflective and critical educational practices throughout their own curricula*, and not, as is all too often the case, in a seminar during the last year of the music teacher education program" (p. 689, emphasis added).

- "By exploring, understanding, and appreciating the multiplicity and complexity of music teacher practice, music education majors can develop their intelligences, forms of expertise, and personalities—in short, *their identities as music teachers*—to the fullest extent possible. . . . *The university may actually exacerbate this problem of professional identity by isolating undergraduates from the real world of public school teaching*" (p. 690, emphasis added).

Preservice Teacher Development and Stages of Concern

Bright, B. (1996). Reflecting on "reflective practice." *Studies in the Education of Adults, 28*(2).

- Examines the skills and processes of "reflective practice" and examines three stages from relation of reflective practice to improved action and outcomes, to recognition and evaluation of outcomes implementation.

Burden, P. R. (1990). Teacher development. In W. Robert Houston (Ed.), *Handbook of Research on Teacher Education* (pp. 311-328). New York: Macmillan.

- Examines various preservice teacher development models (Fuller & Brown, 1975; Caruso, 1977; Yarger & Mertens, 1980; Sacks & Harrington, 1982). See p. 317, Table 18-2, "Preservice Teachers' Developmental Stages."

- The models share an emphasis on individual differences among preservice teachers and the need to individualize interventions and support over extended periods of time. Some models have been criticized for lack of clarity in either defining stages or delineating a mechanism for moving from one stage to the next (p. 318).

Huba, M., & Freed, J. (2000). *Learner-centered assessment on college campuses*. Needham Heights: Allyn & Bacon.

- "Reflective thinking develops over time. It is similar to most conceptions of critical thinking, but it also includes and epistemological dimension. As students become more reflective in their thinking, they must develop in their understanding of what can be known and how knowing occurs" (p.212).

King, P., & Kitchener, K. (1994). *Developing reflective judgment: Understanding and promoting intellectual growth and critical thinking in adolescents and adults*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- According to Huba and Freed (2002), King and Kitchener establish seven stages of reflective thinkers, from the lowest level where candidates do not see a need to reflect, to the highest level where candidates recognize the need for reflection and justification.

Korthagen, F., & Russell, T. (1999, April). *Building teacher education on what we know about teacher development.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Montreal, Quebec, Canada.

- Korthagen and Russell question the effectiveness of traditional teacher education programs built on an application-of-theory model.

- Katz et al. (1981) and Bullough et al. (1991) have shown that preservice teachers often fail to see the value of theory and propositional knowledge until they have experienced a challenge or problem. "This problem can also be stated as follows: *in order to learn anything during teacher education, student teachers must have personal concerns about teaching or they must have encountered concrete problems*" (p. 4, emphasis added).

- Emphasizes "the central role of reflection in teacher development" (p. 7). "We define reflection as *the mental process of trying to structure or restructure an experience, a problem or existing knowledge or insights*" (p. 8, emphasis in original).

- "[T]eacher development is conceptualized as an ongoing process of experiencing practical teaching and learning situations, reflecting on them under the guidance of an expert and developing one's own insights into teaching through the interaction between personal reflection and theoretical notions offered by the expert" (p. 5).

- Instead of attempting to "bridge the gap" from theory to practice, Korthagen and Russell suggest beginning with early, extended field-based experiences, thereby providing preservice teachers with an immediate opportunity to derive theory (or gain "situated knowledge") from their experiences with guidance from a mentor/supervisor. This is termed the "realistic approach."

Newman, C., Moss, B., Lenarz, M., & Newman, I. (1998, October). *The impact of a PDS internship/student teaching program on the self-efficacy, stages of concern and role perceptions of preservice teaching.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Midwestern Educational Research Association, Chicago, IL.

- Examined 15 preservice teachers' reflective abilities after immersion into a PDS environment.

- "It is the researchers' belief that the cohort participants were able to move to higher levels of concern more quickly because they were continually encouraged to collaborate and to reflect on the effects of their actions on their students" (p. 7).

Reven, F., Cartwright, C., & Munday, R. (1997). Developmental phases of preservice secondary teachers. *Journal of Instructional Psychology, 24*(4), 240-245.

- From the ERIC abstract: "A qualitative study (multiple-case study design using reflective journals, in-depth semistructured interviews, and intensive personal observations) of eight secondary preservice teachers to determine professional growth phases during a field-based teacher education program leading to public school certification. Study identified six categories of professional growth: anticipation, adjustment, redefinition, transformation, commitment, and renewed anticipation."

Zielinski, E. J., & Preston, D. D. (1992, March). *The evolution of preservice science teachers' concerns about teaching.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the National Association of Research in Science Teaching, Boston, MA.

- Developed and administered a "Preservice Stages of Concern Questionnaire" based on Hall, George, & Rutherford (1979) stages of concern (N = 67).

- Preservice teachers' concerns were primarily information-centered prior to being involved in teaching situations (Freshman and Sophomore years), after which their concerns shifted to student-centered issues (during junior level practica).

- Based on their findings and those in previous studies, Zielinski and Preston suggest that preservice teachers may not be able to think reflectively about teaching until they have been in a teaching situation. Findings "may indicate that *a preservice teacher is not ready to become reflective until they have been confronted with a teaching situation*" (p. 7, emphasis added).

Zulich, J., Bean, T. W., & Herrick, J. (1992). Charting stages of preservice teacher development and reflection in a multicultural community through dialogue journal analysis. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 8*(4), 345-360.

- Examined the influence of personal biography on preservice teachers' development. Dialogue journals of eight students (most post-baccalaureate) were analyzed using a constant-comparative method to identify themes and categories.

- Analysis of dialogue journals revealed patterns consistent with Burden's (1990) findings regarding stages of concern – introductory (idealism), intermediate (concern for self and effectiveness of teaching methods), and immersion (student-centered concerns).

- Stages may overlap and are affected by personal biography and the degree to which the student identifies with the prevailing "discipline subculture" (p. 357).

- Subscribing to the ideas and practices of the discipline subculture is portrayed as a potential hindrance in the development process. For example, "Marge was a very positive student who understood the pedagogical limitations of the lecture method and refused to become mired in her discipline subculture" (p. 353).

- The major turning point in teacher development: shifting concerns from self (survival) and content to the student – this represents "a real evolution in becoming a teacher. . . . It marks a significant change in teacher development where the student teacher comes out of the all-encompassing concern for survival and displays real concern for individual student learning" (pp. 354-355).

- Implications for teacher preparation programs:
  - Preservice teachers should have opportunities to analyze their personal biographies within the framework of teacher development stages.
  - They should also interview experienced teachers regarding their development as teachers.

- By using autobiographies, dialogue journals, and other reflective approaches, we may be able to better understand who our students are. "Most importantly, we can transform the predominant model of teacher preparation from a technocratic apprenticeship to a process of communication and growth for preservice teachers, their cooperating mentors, and their students" (p. 359).

Reflective Practice in Preservice Teacher Preparation Programs

Adler, S. A. (1990, February). *The reflective practitioner and the curriculum of teacher education.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Association of Teacher Educators, Las Vegas, NV.

- A good overview of three theories of reflective practice (Cruikshank, Schon, and Zeichner). Discusses various strategies for promoting reflective practice among preservice teachers.

- The ability to "problematize" teaching situations is important. The implication for teacher preparation: the program "must emphasize learning by doing and coaching" (p. 7).

- Practicum logs and seminars have been used by some to encourage the "problematization" of teaching situations. Autobiography and ethnography are also potential tools for examining the ethical and political implications of teachers' actions in the classroom. Adler notes that evidence of the strategies' effectiveness is limited.

- "[R]eflection has to begin by getting students to think about themselves and their own experiences" (p. 15). A critical pedagogy approach begins with an examination of preservice teachers' presuppositions regarding teaching and learning. The next step involves instilling a "sense of agency" in preservice teachers through guided problem solving with the intent of uncovering, addressing, and reframing tacit theories of teaching and learning.

- In methods classes, Adler & Goodman (1986) suggest the following sequence for encouraging the development of critical reflection skills: students (a) reexamine their own school experience, (b) consider their discipline in terms of ideals, (c) use data interviews, observations, and textbook analyses to describe the present status of their discipline in the schools, and (d) "synthesize their personal knowledge with the ideas gathered from other class members and readings" (p. 20). Those ideas are also applied to field experiences in which students are directly involved in curriculum development based on critical reflection.

- Some difficulties in developing critical reflection among preservice teachers:
    - "Preservice teachers are often very focused on learning the 'best' way and become impatient with inquiry oriented activities" (p. 22).
    - Frequently the prevailing practices encountered in their field experience and university courses do not support reflective practice.
    - The development and implementation of self-analysis skills is a challenge.

Barry, N. H. (1994, November). *Promoting reflective practice among undergraduate education majors in an elementary music methods course.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Mid-South Education research Association, Nashville, TN.

- See also: Barry, N. H. Promoting Reflective Practice in an Elementary Music Methods Course, *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, Spring 1996, 6-13.

- Barry examined students' (*n* = 45; 44 female, 1 male) perceptions of various reflective activities employed in an elementary music methods course with regard to the activities' usefulness to them as teachers in the future and the amount of thought and reflection required in each activity. Students rated 14 activities using a Likert-type scale (0-5).

- Students tended to give high ratings to "hands-on" activities (e.g., laboratory teaching experiences, lesson plan construction) in terms of future usefulness and the amount of thought and reflection involved.

- Journal writing received the lowest rating for usefulness and the second-to-lowest rating for amount of thought and reflection required. Barry postulated that the students either did not understand the purpose of the journal or were simply lazy and did not take it seriously.

- Barry concluded that "*students may require an external impetus to promote reflection*" and that teacher educators should "*structure [courses] to promote more thoughtful and consistent journal entries. . . . Preservice teachers may lack the internal motivation and/or the experiential framework to engage in reflective practice*" (pp. 8-10, emphasis added).

Dewey, J. (1933). *How we think*. New York: Heath and Company.

- Seminal work on critical thinking and reflective thought.

Freese, A. R. (1999). The role of reflection on preservice teachers' development in the context of a professional development school. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 15*(8), 895-909.

- Defines reflection "as the process of making sense of one's experiences by deliberately and *actively examining one's thoughts and actions to arrive at new ways of understanding oneself as a teacher*" (898, emphasis added). Freese used Loughran's (1995) framework for reflection: *anticipatory reflection* (during planning), *contemporaneous reflection* (while teaching), and *retrospective reflection* (after the lesson).

- Freese and the mentor teachers in the PDS modeled the use of this tri-fold framework while teaching the pre-service teachers and public school students throughout the internship. Using the reflective framework allowed for a shared vocabulary among the preservice teachers, mentor teachers, and the investigator; this led to fruitful group discussions. This was supplemented with dialogue journals that preservice teachers used to pose questions as they observed mentor teachers in their classrooms.

- Freese collected data on the perceived usefulness of the three-part reflective framework by interviewing the preservice teachers and analyzed the data using a constant comparative method to identify categories and themes. "They view their responsibility to be teaching for understanding as opposed to going through the motions of teaching" (p. 903). "Instead of providing a checklist of instructional strategies and do's and don'ts [*sic*], the preservice teachers discovered together different ways of looking at learning, teaching, and *what it means to be a teacher*" (p. 904, emphasis added).

Galvez-Martin, M. E., & Bowman, C. (1998, February). *Reflection and the preservice teacher.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Association of Teacher Educators, Dallas, TX.

- Preservice teachers can be taught self-reflection skills using a clearly defined framework.

- "When preservice teachers engage in reflective activities, they improve considerably on their levels of reflection [as measured by various validated instruments]. . . . [P]reservice teachers tend to be more reflective when they receive specific training on reflective thinking" (p. 12).

Greene, M. L., & Campbell, C. (1993). *Becoming a teacher: The contribution of teacher education.* Alberta Department of Education, Edmonton.

- Longitudinal qualitative study of 12 undergraduate students in a two-semester practicum.

- Familiarity with the classroom environment may be a pitfall for preservice teachers; they may take things for granted without thinking critically about their teaching, etc. (Buchmann, 1989).

- "Reflection. . . does not just happen." *Students need to be taught reflective thinking skills and be afforded multiple opportunities to practice those skills.*

Kraus, S., & Butler, K. (2000, February). *Reflection is not description: Cultivating reflection with preservice teachers.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, Chicago, IL.

- Application of reflective thinking and practice as defined by Dewey (1933), Eby (1998), and Schon (1987).

- "Reflective dispositions must be fostered over a period of time and in a variety of situations" (p. 1).

- Described the sequence of education courses at Glenville (WV) State College based on three development stages.
    - *Foundation* (intro courses): use of classroom inquiry and discussion and dialogue journals with instructors to reflect on major educational theories and practice.
    - *Process* (methods courses): reflective journals addressing assigned topics (with instructor feedback, sometimes built around specific artifacts or news items), written reflection on and class discussion of mini-lesson segments, discussion of "why" in addition to "what," log of teaching techniques observed and how they could be implemented.
    - *Reflective Practice* (student teaching): reflective journals, self assessment, lesson plan reflections (built into the lesson plan form), "cluster meetings" for debriefing and discussion with peers and supervisor.

Loughran, J. (1994, April). *Learning how to teach: Unpacking a teacher educator's thinking about pedagogy in pre-service education.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans, LA.

- Described three types of reflection: anticipatory, contemporaneous, and retrospective.
    - Anticipatory reflection goes beyond mere lesson plan construction and involves considering the variety of possible scenarios that may present challenges during the course of the lesson as well as any appropriate solutions.
    - Contemporaneous reflection, the most difficult of the three, involves "thinking on your feet" and the decisions that are made during the act of teaching.
    - Retrospective reflection involves a rehearsal of what transpired during the lesson, what could have gone better and why, etc.

- Loughran modeled reflection for his preservice teachers by using "think-alouds" in his own teaching and by sharing his reflective journal entries with his students.

- Once the preservice teachers were past the survival stage of their first practice teaching rounds, most were able to begin using reflection to inform their own teaching.

- "The more these contextual issues [of teaching and learning] are explored the greater the possibility that development beyond a purely technical approach to (and understanding of) teaching might occur. Hence there is a need for teachers to reflect on the relationship between the act of teaching and the experience of learning" (p. 7).

Rodgers, C. (2002). Defining reflection: another look at John Dewey and reflective thinking. *Teachers College Record, 104*(4), 842-866.

- Maintains that John Dewey's conclusions related to reflection have been over-generalized and thus the meaning of "reflection" has "suffered a loss of meaning." Rodgers distills Dewey's work into four criteria for reflection.

Ross, D. D. (1990). Programmatic structures for the preparation of reflective teachers. In R. T. Clift, W. R. Houston, & M. C. Pugach (Eds.), *Encouraging Reflective Practice in Education: An Analysis of Issues and Programs* (pp. 97-118). New York: Teachers College, Columbia University.

- Developing reflective teachers requires the concerted efforts of all faculty members within the program. This involves
    - adopting a common definition of reflection,
    - employing a variety of strategies to encourage reflection (see below),
    - building a logically sequenced program,
    - developing collaborative partnerships with schools,
    - supporting graduates, and
    - evaluating the program.

- Discusses various programmatic strategies to encourage reflection:
    - o Reflective teaching (Cruickshank)
    - o Inquiry activities (action research)
    - o Reflective writing
    - o Reflective supervisory approach
    - o Faculty modeling of reflection
    - o Questioning and dialogue

Schöen, D. A. (1983). *The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action.* New York: Basic Books, Inc.

- This text informs the development of an "epistemology of practice which places technical problem-solving within a broader context of reflective inquiry, showing how reflection-in-action may be rigorous in its own right" and linked to practice (p.69).

Schöen, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner.* San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

- This book is intended for individuals in schools or practice settings and provides insight into developing a reflective practicum "to help students become proficient in a kind of reflection-in-action" (p.xii).

Strategies for Promoting Reflective Practice among Preservice Teachers

Reflective Journaling

Bolin, A. U., Khramtsova, I., & Saarnio, D. (2005). Using student journals to stimulate authentic learning: Balancing Bloom's cognitive and affective domains. *Teaching of Psychology, 32*(3), 154-159.

- Students in this study valued "the affective outcomes of journal writing. . . . Students want to understand why they are learning the material, and students who believed that they understood why gave higher ratings to course outcomes" (p. 157).

- Implication for teacher preparation: Journaling can be an effective tool for involving students in the learning process. It allows students to apply concepts and ideas to their own lives, thereby giving them a sense of immediate application of course material.

- Challenges: how often to collect journals, finding adequate time to read the journals, devising a system for assigning grades. One solution: effort-based grading.

Carter, C. W. (1998). The use of journals to promote reflection. *Action in Teacher Education, 19*(4), 39-42.

- Examined the effectiveness of journal writing in promoting reflection among preservice teachers enrolled in an educational psychology course. Based on Dewey's conception of reflective (critical) thinking.

- Students believed that journaling helped them to examine their own beliefs and caused them to be more receptive to changing their beliefs.

Gordinier, C. L., Moberly, D. A., & Conway, K. (2004). Scaffolding enables reflective thinking to become a disposition. *Childhood Education, 80*(3), 146.

- Through the use of reflective logs and group discussions, "[t]eacher candidates become more aware of their ability to make appropriate instructional decisions, and reflective thinking becomes more automatic."

Longhurst, J., & Sandage, S. A. (2004). Appropriate technology and journal writing: Structured dialogues that enhance learning. *College Teaching, 52*(2), 69-75.

- Journaling is an ideal way to involve students in the learning process. It is an effective means of encouraging students to complete reading assignments and check understanding of course content. Structured journal assignments can be "low-risk" assessments that motivate and inform.

- Traditional paper-and-pencil journals can be unwieldy and cumbersome – and so can the latest technological "solutions." Longhurst and Sandage use dedicated e-mail accounts to correspond with students in a timely fashion without the hassle of missing notebooks or steep learning curves (everyone knows e-mail).

Martindale, T., & Wiley, D. A. (2005). Using weblogs in scholarship and teaching. *TechTrends, 49*(2), 55-61.

- Weblogs are a dynamic tool for encouraging an ongoing exchange of ideas. They are more "permanent" than discussion forums, especially those hosted in a proprietary system like Blackboard, because they can continue to be accessed and used after the course is completed.

- The logistics of hosting websites and maintaining server space is an issue. Should the student be required to pay for a host site? Should the school host the site instead? What happens when the student leaves?

Williams, D. A. (1999). Using out-of-class time in educationally purposeful ways. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 9*(1), 18-24.

- The use of online forums and electronic course journals to extend class discussions and promote dialogue and the exchange of ideas between students and teachers has improved the music education program at the University of South Florida.

- Because electronic messages are time-stamped, students write their entries while the experience/class session/observation is still fresh in their minds instead of waiting until just before the journal is due to write several entries at once.

Portfolios

Bauer, W., & Dunn, R. (2003). Digital reflection: the electronic portfolio in music teacher education. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 13*(1), 7-20.

- Citing Ormrod (1995), Bauer and Dunn maintain that the e-portfolio may serve as an advanced organizer, but more importantly it helps candidates to see connections within and among courses in the music education curriculum and "understand how the various curricular components relate to their goal of becoming a music teacher, resulting in more meaningful learning" (p.16).

Berg, M. H., & Lind, V. R. (2003). Preservice music teacher electronic portfolios: Integrating reflection and technology. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 12*(2), 18-28.

- "Student essays written at the end of the semester provided evidence of reflective thinking and showed evidence that constructing an electronic portfolio did facilitate reflective practice." "Students were able to reflect on their teaching, analyze their strengths and weaknesses, and set goals for continued improvement" (p.22).
.

Klenowski, V. (2002). *Developing portfolios for learning and assessment*. New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

- "The portfolio has the potential to provide a structure and processes for documenting, reflecting and making public learning and teaching practices" (p.37).

- Portfolio assessment can be used to "support the acquisition of professional attitudes and develop strategies of reflective thinking and critical self-evaluation" (p.38).

- Klenowski provides several case studies that illustrate the impact of portfolio development on skills and outcomes of reflection and reflective practice.

Zubizarreta, J. (2004). *The learning portfolio*. Bolton: Anker Publishing.

- "This book argues that the durable value of portfolios in improving student learning resides in engaging students not just in collecting representative samples of the work for assessment, evaluation, or career preparation but in addressing vital reflective questions that invite systematic and protracted inquiry" (p.8).

Assessment of Student Reflections

Creme, P. (2005). Should student learning journals be assessed? *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education, 30*(3), 287-296.

- Cites Stierer (2000) regarding reflective journaling in a professional education course. Students tended to take a formulaic approach to their reflective writing assignments. "While the process of reflection through the course may have been 'transformative', it seemed that 'writing' it, to what felt like a given formula, became a matter of simply doing what was required" (p. 293).

- "To assess learning journals formally would demonstrate that the academy recognizes and values this different way of constructing and writing knowledge in its students; on the other hand, assessment may undermine the very qualities that we value in the journal [i.e., open-ended exploration of issues]. I have suggested as a compromise that we use a range of formative kinds of assessment for the journals themselves, and then assess summatively a new, final product" (p. 295).

Crotty, T., & Allyn, D. (2001). *Evaluating student reflections*. University of Wisconsin – River Falls. ERIC # ED 459 174

- Described the development of a rubric for evaluating preservice teachers' reflections in conjunction with electronic portfolios.

- The rubric was based on the ten Wisconsin Teacher Standards and Bloom's taxonomy. Students reflected "on how, why, and where they met the learning outcomes and Wisconsin Teacher Standards with the videotaped assignments [of their own teaching]" (p.1).

Jay, T., & Brooks, P. (2004). "Self-censorship in course diaries." *College Teaching, 52*(3), 82-86.

- Examined students' self-censorship of diaries in psychology and non-psychology courses.

- Found that the likelihood of self-censorship is greater in courses that involve highly personal information than in an internship course, "probably because the diary component permitted them to see their own intellectual growth in an applied setting. . ." (p. 85).

Norton, J. L. (1994, February). *The effects of time, teaching certification type, and field placement on reflective thinking in preservice teachers.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Association of Teacher Educators, Atlanta, GA.

- Used a predetermined framework (Pedagogical Language Acquisition and Conceptual Development Taxonomy of Teacher Reflective Thought, or "RPT Taxonomy") to train students ($n = 13$) to write reflective dialogue journals. Also used the RPT Taxonomy to rate the level of reflection displayed in each of eight entries.

- RPT Taxonomy (Simmons, Sparks, Starko, Pasch, & Colton, 1989)
   Descriptions of teaching activities
    - Level 1: no description
    - Level 2: uses only layperson terms
    - Level 3: uses appropriate pedagogical terminology
   Explanations of teaching activities
    - Level 4: based on personal experience, tradition
    - Level 5: applies pedagogical principles to address cause and effect
    - Level 6: considers context and situational influences that affect learning
    - Level 7: assesses the ethical, moral, and political import of educational decisions

- Found that students became generally more reflective throughout the course of the semester. "Informal observations and conversations with preservice teachers suggested dialogue journals may have been major catalysts in promoting and refining strategies of reflective thought. Explicit guidelines for writing reflective journals, journal topics complementing seminar discussions, and extensive probing and feedback from field supervisors were frequently mentioned as instrumental in developing reflective thinking" (p. 20).

Ross, D. D. (1989). First steps in developing a reflective approach. *Journal of Teacher Education, 40*(2), 22-30.

- Used a rubric based on a seven-stage model of the development of reflective judgment (Kitchner, 1977; King, 1977) to evaluate students' reflection in 134 theory-to-practice papers written throughout a semester.

- Theory-to-practice papers: connect an idea from class discussion or reading with specific practices observed in pre-college classrooms.

- Findings from theory-to-practice paper analyses:
    - Most students' quality of reflection varied throughout the course.
    - The quality of reflection did not improve over time.
    - Paper topic seemed to affect the level of reflection (e.g., mechanics of teaching techniques vs. application of research findings)
    - Students generally were able to recognize and analyze effective classroom practices in some detail, though they tended to oversimplify cause and effect relationships.

- An implication of this study: students' reflective abilities should be assessed to gain a better understanding of the students' perspectives. Only then can you help them address misconceptions and beliefs regarding teaching and learning.

Impediments to the Development of Music Teacher--Impact of the social context in the Music School on the Emerging Identity of future music educator: A Literature Review

D. Hellman
Anna Maria College

Teacher attrition and the shortage of music teachers have been serious issues in music education for several years. Considerable attrition from the teaching profession occurs early in teacher's careers. As teaching candidates matriculate through teaching programs, approximately half eventually pursue and obtain teaching positions (Marso & Pigge, 1997). Of these approximately half leave the profession within five years (Darling-Hammond, 2002). The manner in which teaching candidates and novice teachers view themselves is an important indicator of their future continuation in the profession and should have the full attention of those involved in music education. It has been suggested that the lack of a strong teacher music teacher identity has been identified as a contributing factor to teacher attrition among music teachers (Hellman, 2005).

The conception that future music teachers derive of themselves occurs through the interactions they have with significant others including former music teachers, college teachers, colleagues, parents and friends (Berger & Luckmann, 1966). This occurs early in life through primary socialization, in which children assume the musical roles and attitudes of parents and significant others, and later through secondary socialization, in which music students view music teachers as a career role models (Woodford, 2002). Although primary socialization processes are more resilient than secondary socialization processes, most future music teachers experience teacher socialization via secondary socialization processes (Woodford, 2002). Berger and Luckman (1966) postulate that some fields of study such as music require deeper levels of identification, immersion and affect in order for secondary socialization to occur and that this is fulfilled by institutionalized practices. Music education may necessitate even greater levels of

association, given that the wide variety of knowledge and skills involved in music teaching

evades precise definition (Woodford, 2002).

Rose (1998, in Woodford, 2002) and Beynon (1998, in Woodford, 2002) consider the

development of music teacher identity as social activism in which basic assumptions are

questioned, unique understandings regarding teaching are devised, and the gap between what is

and what could be are realized. As reported by Woodford, their separate but complementary

ethnographic studies, although very small in scope, suggest that college music teacher educators

should promote critical reflection and analysis of the teaching-learning environment, if future

teachers are to develop a professional identity. The idealism of these approaches have great

merit for the development of astute thinking educators; however, both prospective music

teachers and music teacher educators must develop and maintain realistic relationships with

practicing teachers in existing programs in K-12 schools and higher education institutions.

Clearly, the development of a mature personal identity does require transformation on some level.

In any case, in order to examine the potentialities for transformation, we must first examine the

nature of the undergraduate experience in music education.

Within higher education institutions, the personal identities of future music teachers are

shaped by mutual interactions and affirmation from significant others and casual acquaintances

(Roberts, 1993). Undergraduates appear to identify with former school and private music

teachers as significant others and develop a personal orientation towards either teaching or

performance, but a professional identity as a music teacher does not appear to develop during the

undergraduate experience (Roberts 1991, 1993, 2001; L'Roy, 1983; Woodford, 2002). In other

words, music teaching may be viewed as a primary or secondary goal, depending on the

student's perspective, but even for those students who select music teaching as a college major

for the exclusive purpose of teaching music in the schools, they identify most strongly as a music

performer. Woodford (2002) speculates that this may result from (a) robust music performance

socialization processes (b) high social status and recognition for music performance

achievement, and (c) the wide variety of skills involved in music teaching.

These issues are involved in research by (Roberts 1991, 1993, 2000), and Kingsbury

(1988). L'Roy (1983) examined similar topics, but she was not concerned with social context

except as it relates to career commitment. Roberts used a symbolic interactionist perspective

while Kingsbury took an anthropological approach. Kingsbury was not concerned specifically

with music education, but similar issues were examined in his study within the context of a

conservatory. In general, these studies involved data collected via self-report and observation

and are quite indicting of the social context that music education majors experience in the music

school. Kingsbury examined a single institution while Roberts examined 12 institutions across

Canada in order to build a grounded theory concerning the social context of music education.

Based on extensive interviews and observations at Canadian universities, Roberts (1993)

theorized that undergraduate music education students gain or lose acceptance, individual value,

and social status on ongoing basis in the music school via other's perception of their musical

performance skills (Roberts, 1993). In this research, he observed that within the social life of

musicians studying in a music school, status as a musician was central, and students gained

status in the music school through their association with their private teacher, placement in more

prestigious ensembles, attainment of a higher chair in those ensembles and pursuit a major in

performance as well as through competitive awards, such as scholarships and performance

contests. In this line of research, what seems particularly relevant to the development of music

teacher identity is that important impressions of the program are revealed through the audition

process, and significant and referent others are influential in the development of an identity in the

music school.   Because these qualitative studies dealt with an extensive amount of data at a

small number of institutions, global generalizations are not appropriate; however, the intent of

this review is to examine research on social context of the music school that is relevant to music

teacher identity development.

Induction Processes

While future music education majors identify with their performing medium, it appears

that this identity is threatened by the competitive nature of the audition process (Roberts 1991,

1993). Students reported that they were required to demonstrate musical performance prowess

during the entrance audition far beyond that which was required for satisfactory grades in high

school music courses. This contrasts greatly with entrance procedures from college majors

outside the school of music. On the other hand, students entered the school of music with an

official designation by virtue of an audition in which they are accepted to study in a music

degree program, and this designation appeared to hold value as a mark of accomplishment and

status.

During the audition, prospective students began their association with the music school

understanding that the audition served as an important social filter and established legitimacy for

their identity as a musician within this closed community (Roberts, 1991). As part of this

process, faculty demonstrated little regard for them as persons, strong value for performance as a

major, and used an established standard that was flexible in order to meet the needs for recruiting

needed ensemble members. Prospective students came to understand that mastery of academic

subjects was less valued than performance, and the status rewards of the music school was

reserved for those who displayed technically superior performances and performed only classical

music. They learned that the music school was rooted in firm traditions and the music school in

general lacked respect for diverse genres and styles of music. Finally, the audition was

perceived as a serious threat to the musician identity of even the most prepared candidates.

Once the audition was successful, access to the community was universal particularly

during the orientation of the new academic year, and new music students experienced an open

and welcoming instant sense of community (Roberts, 1991). Most significantly, community

acceptance was reserved for those who passed the audition. Roberts observed that music

education students who attended an institution where they were not officially based in the school

of music experienced substantially more isolation from the community of musicians than those

based in the music school. At the very early stages, music education majors perceived that their

relationship with their private music instructor took on a special place of importance within the

music school.

Significant and Referent Others

Prior to entering the music school, music education students typically used public school

music teachers, private teachers and community musicians as role models (Roberts, 1993;

Kingsbury, 1988). Once formal study began in the music school, music students used their

applied teachers as their primary referent other and also as their most significant support for

identity as a musician. The relationship between the private teacher and student was mutually

beneficial as both the teacher and the student gained status based on the other's performing

prowess and reputation; although, the private teacher obviously had significant power in the

relationship, music students trusted that their teacher would enable them to succeed in the music

school both academically and socially (Roberts, 1993). Music education students did perceive

that this status in the music school was based exclusively on performing prowess, and they were

aware that additional skills were needed for successful teaching. Unfortunately, they felt that

performance teachers belittled the value of music education, and that they often attempted to

steer students away from music education. While the influence of the private teacher appeared

robust, the role of other music faculty was less clear. Students expressed little enthusiasm for

their studies in other areas such as music theory, music history and music education, and did not

hold these faculty as role models. Whether this was due to the length of the relationship with the

private teacher or because music was equated strictly with performance was not fully detailed in

this line of research. Nevertheless, students expected all music faculty to support them by attending their recitals.

Incoming students used upperclassmen as an important reference group in order to determine the standards of the music school (Roberts, 1993), and overall, peers' influence upon one another involved quite a bit of drama in the music school. Powerful cliques existed, and acceptance by these cliques was central to earning status as a musician. Most significantly after the private teacher, other students who played the same instrument served as important referent others. They shared common struggles and provided support as well as competition; however, underneath the actual competition, there was an almost ubiquitous checking out of the competition that seemed to permeate. For many students, this constant measuring up was particularly stressful; for example, students reported that other students would eavesdrop on their individual practice sessions. Supportive friendships did emerge that would occasionally mitigate the effects of these situations. Demonstrating verbal knowledge of music was important as well; criticism of peer's performances provided opportunities for music students to demonstrate music listening skills, which enhanced their status within the music school but also resulted in a negative status effect for the performer. Attending concerts and recitals held little value for status as a musician within the music school, and students did not generally attend peer recitals unless attendance was required, a friend was performing, or a performing peer held high status as a musician (Roberts, 1993; Kingsbury, 1988).

Roberts (1991) also noted that music education majors held considerable resentment towards performance majors because they receive undeserved privileges and recognition through preferred placements in competitions, recitals, courses, ensembles, and private lessons as well as an overall privileged and unjustified social status. In interviews, music education majors described being verbally insulted, belittled, ignored and dismissed on the basis of their degree status. While this attitude appeared to come directly from performance students; the perception

was that faculty were contributors. In general, music education majors often dismissed

performance majors as out of touch, uninformed and unrealistic. While performance majors

often had higher attributed status on the basis on their degree program, music education majors

claimed to be equally qualified but focused their efforts on more beneficial and realistic pursuits.

In some cases music education majors simply identified as performance majors or failed to

reveal that they were music education majors in order to retain social status and friendships.

What seemed abundantly clear to music education majors was that solo performing and

performance were tied to self-worth within the music school. While it appears that music

education students perceive their identity as being seriously threatened by performance majors,

Allen (2003) found that music education majors developed a stronger career identity over the

course of their undergraduate preparation while performance majors' career identity declined.

In research on music teacher preparation in Sweden, Bouj (2000, 2004) found that some music

education students who were less focused on performance began to consider themselves as all

around musicians. The process appears complex, but the social context appears to impact on the

way that future music teachers view themselves.

Relationships outside the music school generally held less influence than those within the

music school (Roberts 1991, 1993). Music students reported that although their parents and

family generally supported their decision to attend college, they were fairly ambivalent towards

music and music education study, because it did not appear to have substantive potential for job

security. Music students also reported that strong physical, emotional and social barriers

prevented the larger campus community from participating in the life of the music school as well

as students in the music school from participating in the greater campus community. This

resulted in a shared perception that music students were underrepresented in interactions with the

larger academic world. Music students were often satisfied with the lack of social connections

outside the music school because the music school was sufficient to fulfill their social needs.

Music students also related that their collegiate peers outside the school of music viewed music

study as easy, fun, lacking rigor and worthless; consequently, music students were perceived as

social misfits, odd, eccentric and out of touch, and music was thought of as a clique, silly little

club or high school. While music students often did not dispute the accuracy of these

perceptions, they perceived that their non-music peers did not understand the time commitment

required due to their extensive coursework, rehearsals and practice time nor did they

acknowledge music study as worthwhile.

Discussion

Based on this review, the possibility exists that institutional effects influence

identity development in music education students. While none of the studies in this review are

generalizable, they serve to remind us that schools of music are social institutions, and the

education of future music teachers involve an environment ripe with diverse social interactions.

As teacher educators, we envision well-structured curricula that will achieve important goals and

facilitate essential skills; but, we should realize that student engagement in the hidden curriculum

can be quite a powerful (Zeichner & Gore, 1990). Significant socialization occurs during the

higher education experience, and certainly the music school is no exception (Kingsbury, 1988;

Roberts, 2004, 2001, 1993, 1991).

This social context of the undergraduate experience and the development of identity for

music education students are mired with complexities. Some writers have identified the lack of

development of a teacher identity during the undergraduate experience in music education as a

serious issue and have suggested that it is necessary to break from identifying with former or

model teachers in order to begin to develop a teacher identity (Woodford, 2002). Additionally,

identity development is quite malleable during the traditional college years, and a great deal of

change and experimentation is likely. While the development of identity is an intricate process,

some students do not even desire to develop a music teacher identity because they are not

attracted to music teaching itself, but only as a back up plan in case music performance is not a viable career option.

A performer identity is bound to be strong given the hours spent as a performer in the undergraduate program, but a strong performer identity or an orientation towards performance does not necessarily preclude the emergence of either a teacher identity or an orientation towards teaching; Roberts (2000) notes that "nothing is taken away from a teacher simply because he becomes a teacher in addition to being a musician." Although a performer identity can be linked to the perception of performer competence through performance demonstration, music teacher identity is more elusive because it cannot be directly linked to specific actions. Clearly, the nature of teaching involves not only displaying one's own skill but also the ability to enable others to gain knowledge and develop skills. Music teaching requires the ability to develop, maintain and sustain relationships in addition to the essential musical and pedagogical skills required. What may inhibit future music teachers' identity development is that they lack opportunities to develop, maintain and sustain those relationships needed for a music teacher identity while enrolled in the School of Music.

The School of Music generally serves the needs of a variety of music majors as well as nonmajors, and the greatest commonality throughout the School of Music is performance. Requirements for private performance study and ensemble participation are nearly ubiquitous each semester of study for all music majors, at least at the undergraduate level, and college students outside the school of music tend to equate music study wholly with performance. As expected, the performance identity receives a great deal of support within the School of Music, but the degree to which students experience isolation both inside and outside the School of Music shapes the development of a music teacher identity while enrolled in the School of Music as well as during the early years of teaching.

Isolation within the music school could have far reaching implications for music education students, particularly if a temporary lack success in music performance becomes equated with self worth. Music performance is certainly an area of important competence in music; however, the extent to which music education majors internalize themselves and their future profession as less valuable due to social isolation factors is problematic. Social isolation from other music students is one issue, while isolation from the larger community is quite another. If music education students have few meaningful social interactions outside the music school, they may be unprepared for the larger net of relationships required of music teachers, particularly in the early years of teaching when developing these relationships are especially critical.

Implications for Supporting Future Music Teachers

Music teacher educators have an important part to play both inside and outside the classroom in supporting music education students in their desire to become music teachers. Private college teachers are significant others for music education students as musical influences, but many also demonstrate a personal commitment and interest to their students. The college music teacher educator could have an influential role as well; in addition to the formal function of music teacher educators as college teachers and supervisors who guide aspiring teachers pedagogically, music teacher educators can also adopt a significant mentoring role throughout the undergraduate curriculum in order to help music education students assume a music teacher identity. For example, music teacher educators can encourage future music teachers to interact with the greater campus community beyond the music school. By taking an interest in music education students on a personal level, music teacher educators can influence the development of a music teacher identity within future music teachers.

Suggestions for Research

Considering the importance of the undergraduate experience for future music teachers, the impact of the social context upon the development of music teacher identity is certainly worthy of additional study. The work of Roberts and Kingsbury provide much needed data regarding the influence of the social context of music teachers; however future studies should address whether music education students are even able to develop a music teacher identity and how different types of institutions might influence its development. Conservatories, large universities, regional colleges and universities offer vastly different types of music schools depending on their size, facilities, funding, and traditions. Perhaps, these different types of institutions offer different strengths for prospective music teachers. Conversely, while perspectives from the point of view of higher education institutions are important, valuable information could be also gained by examining how music teachers who persist in the profession perceive the social context of their undergraduate experience.   Practicing teachers could provide valuable insights concerning the environmental aspects of their preservice preparation as well as the curricular aspects.

The ability to interact successfully within the larger world is vital for music teachers, and interactions will be difficult if music teachers believe that they are odd or strange with compared with the non-musician world. Future research should detail the quality and types of interactions that aspiring music teachers have with the larger academic community. If music education students are apprehensive about interacting with the greater community or are unable due to do so because the requirements involved in music teacher preparation are extensive, this deserves the attention of music teachers educators. While our academic programs are important for teachers success in the future, building relationships with those outside the music profession is essential so that music programs at all levels can flourish.

REFERENCES

Allen, M. L. (2003). A longitudinal study of vocational commitment among undergraduate music majors. *Journal of Music Teacher Education 12* (2) Retrieved March 11, 2006 from http://www.menc.org/mbronly/publication/Fall03JMT.pdf

Berger, P. L. & Luckmann, T. (1966). *A treatise in the sociology of knowledge.* Garden City NY: Anchor Books

Bouj, C. (2004). Two theoretical perspective on the socialization of music teachers. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education 3* Retrieved August 1, 2005 from http://www.siue.edu/MUSIC/ACTPAPERS/v3/Bouij04.pdf

Bouj, C. (2000). Music teacher socialization: Report from a Swedish research project. In R. R. Rideout & S. J. Paul (eds.), *On the Socialization of Music Education II: Papers from the music education symposium at the University of Oklahoma.* (pp. 51 – 62) Amherst: Privately published

Darling-Hammond, L. (2002). *Solving the dilemmas of teacher supply, demand, and standards: How we can ensure a competent, caring, and qualified teacher for every child.* [On-line]. Retrieved September 1, 2002 from http://www.nctaf.org/publications/solving.pdf

Hellman, D. S. (under review). Do music education majors intend to teach music? An exploratory survey. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education.*

L'Roy, D. A. (1984). The development of occupational identity in undergraduate music education majors. (Doctoral dissertation, North Texas State University, 1983). *Dissertation Abstracts International 44,* 2401.

Kingsbury, H. (1988). *Music, talent, and performance: A conservatory cultural system.* Philadephia: Temple University Press

Marso, R. N. & Pigge, F. L. (1997). A longitudinal study of persisting and nonpersisting teachers' academic and personal characteristics. *Journal of Experimental Education, 65,* 243 – 254.

Roberts, B. A. (2004). Who's in the mirror? Issues surrounding the identity construction of music educators. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education 3* (2). Retrieved September 29, 2005 from http://mas.siue,edu/ACT/v3/Roberts04.pdf

Roberts, B. A. (2000). A North American response to Bouj: Music education student identity construction revisited in Sweden. In R. R. Rideout & S. J. Paul (eds.), *On the Socialization of Music Education II: Papers from the music education symposium at the University of Oklahoma.* (pp. 51 – 62) Amherst: Privately published

Roberts, B. A. (1993) *I, Musician: Towards a model of Identity Construction and Maintenance by Music Education Students as Musicians.* St. John's, Newfoundland: Memorial University of Newfoundland

Roberts, B. A. (1991) A Place to Play: The Social World of University Schools of Music. St. John's, Newfoundland: Memorial University of Newfoundland

Woodford, P. G. (2002). The social construction of music teacher identity in undergraduate music teacher education. In R. Colwell & C. Richardson (eds.), *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning.* New York: Oxford Press

Zeichner, K. M. & Gore, J. M. (1990). Teacher socialization In W. R. Houston (ed.), *Handbook of research on teacher education.* New York: Macmillian Publishing